## Contents

Contents ..... 1
Appendix 1 Interview Guide ..... 2
Appendix 2 Interview with Ruth ..... 4
Appendix 3 Interview with Jane ..... 13
Appendix 4 Interview with Lydia ..... 21
Appendix 5 Interview with Sarah ..... 24
Appendix 6 Questionnaire ..... 33
Appendix 7 Summarizing Content Analysis Ruth ..... 34
Appendix 8 Summarizing Content Analysis Jane. ..... 52
Appendix 9 Summarizing Content Analysis Lydia. ..... 67
Appendix 10 Summarizing Content Analysis Sarah ..... 72
Appendix 11 Structure-Formation-Technique Ruth ..... 91
Appendix 12 Structure-Formation-Technique Jane ..... 92

## Appendix 1 Interview Guide

## I. Open questions

### 1.1. Teaching experiences (background of the teacher)

- How long have you been a teacher?
- Where and when did you teach?
- Which teaching experiences were most satisfying for you? Can you say why?


### 1.2.Teacher preparation and education

- Where did you do your teacher training?
- Do you feel it prepared you adequately for the job? Explain.
- Do you have any further teacher qualifications?
- What did you find most helpful in your training?
- What was not helpful at all or even a waste of time?


### 1.3.Current teaching situation

- Where are you teaching at the moment?
- Please describe your own classroom:
- How many pupils are in the class?
- Which mother tongues do these pupils speak?
- How do you feel about having different mother tongue speakers in your class?
- Are you able to speak any of their mother tongues?
- Do you use any other languages in class beside the language that is the medium of instruction? (with learners or with parents)


## II. More directed questions

- Since the end of apartheid, mixed multilingual schools have increasingly become the norm.
Has this happened in your classroom? (give details) Have you had to make any changes to your way of teaching?
- Has the introduction of OBE led to any improvements in the way you handle languages? (give details)
- How does your school treat speakers of other languages? (learners and teachers). Have you got any comments about this?
- How do you deal with children who are second language learners?
- How do you respond to learners who have not yet developed enough language skills to keep up with the other learners who are mother tongue speakers?
- How do you deal with linguistic mistakes?
- How do you feel about not always being able to speak the mother tongue of the learners?
- Are there moments when you wish you could speak the mother tongue? In which situations?
- How do you overcome these communication problems (e.g. do you ask another learner to translate a word?)
- What in your opinion is an ideal multilingual teacher?
- What do you believe can best prepare / equip a teacher to be this ideal multilingual teacher? (learning the languages of the pupils, doing a course to learn strategies, etc.)
- Additive bilingualism recommends that
$>$ the L1 (e.g. Xhosa) must be maintained
$>$ learners must have a fundamental grasp of reading and writing in their mother tongue (e.g. Xhosa, Afrikaans) before they formally study / get taught a second language (e.g. English)
$>$ What are your feelings or opinions about these two statements?


## Appendix 2 Interview with Ruth

## I: How long have you been a teacher?

R: I've been teaching for 16-18 years, some full time, some part time. A completely different experience. And then I went back to more long term.
I: Where and when did you teach?
R: 1975 at dual medium school - co-ed (English \& Afrikaans students) as well as girls and boys I taught grade 4 for 3 years and grade 6 for 9 months. I stopped - pregnant. As mother, stayed at home \& did temporary work. And then 8 yrs ago, got my permanent job back again.
I: Looking back and looking at your teaching experiences - anything very satisfying?
R: I enjoy all of it. Taught my dolls as a child ... from way back knew what I wanted to do. In teaching, bad \& good days - but far more good days. To be a teacher, you've got to have a love for people. Whether it's dealing with little/big children, adults, colleagues \& just today being at home - I couldn't just be quiet at home. Even if it's conflict, it's still you yearn for that interaction.
I: Preparation \& education - where did you do your training?
R: At a well known institution in Grahamstown - a very good name. Every teacher who trained there was a good teacher. We were thrown in at the deep end - given our first teaching lesson - I was 17 - my first lesson was a disaster - owned and run by Anglican nuns - which also had an influence on my life - and most girls did 3 years' training - you could choose between teaching the little children $\&$ the older ones. I chose to teach the older ones from grade 4 to grade 7 -changed my mind later on - prefer the little ones. I enjoyed my time there and I just couldn't wait - you think "I've got enough academic education - let me have my own class". We didn't think too much (about a fourth year) - I know some students did a fourth year - but after 3 years you couldn't wait to get into the classroom - and that was the norm in those days. I think it was exactly 20 years later, having taught a lot of relief work and temporary work, jumping from grade one to grade 5 to grade 3 , I realised that the little ones had a draw for me and I enjoyed them very much when I taught the little ones when their teacher was sick, I didn't want their teacher to get better - I was enjoying it so much in grade 2 . I fell in love with my husband and fell in love with grade 2 . I realised that if I was going to stay in the foundation phase, in junior primary, then I needed to get another qualification in that particular phase. So then I studied part time for 2 years. I did that training which helped me to get a permanent position. Then 3 years ago my friend Ros studied and she encouraged me to study further - because a lot of the girls, coming from school, were getting degrees and at that stage I only had a diploma - and I really felt it was necessary to upgrade the diploma to a degree. I studied both times part time and through distance education. So it wasn't the local university or college. I found that suited my needs, because I am quite disciplined and I could just study when I wanted to.I got that qualification this year.
I: And did you feel, looking back at your first college, and also the degrees that you had afterward, did you feel well prepared - you said you felt itchy, going into the class.
R: Yes, but you never, ever stop learning. I think particularly with the new generation - and we call it the new millennium - there is a new generation of children and a new generation of parents - and to understand those parents. A lot of those parents work, both work, or are single parents - and the children are definitely brought up completely differently from the way I was brought up - that's the way I brought my children up - their times are different, eating habits are different. Family times are different - and it's to try and understand ... I have a lot of children in my class this year who have good intelligence, but a lot of emotional problems. And dealing with that, you are learning all the time - because each little child is a unique case study.

I: And this course you did - was there something extremely helpful, also looking at the pupils now are they quite different now and with their family background ...
$\mathbf{R}$ : I was actually amazed at both the institutions at which I studied, they were completely different - and yet they were very apt to what I was doing - and I could use ... I think there's nothing worse than studying something that you can't actually use - and all the modules I did were very practical, hands on I could actually see myself in the classroom within each module - I could relate - the information helped me to be a better teacher and a better colleague - and that's what spurs you on to study more. If you are studying and not using the information, then it's pointless. But I just felt all the time that I was growing, not only as a teacher, but also as a person. The one particular module was called school management skills - and it was extremely interesting to see how a school is run. I was just on the edge of that as a head of department - but it's amazing how many schools in our country are run by people who possibly don't have any backing about how to run a school today - it's like a business - and you have to have certain skills to do that.
I also did quite a few (modules) on language and that is also very interesting. I could relate, which was such a plus factor for me. I was inspired. The assignments we did ... I could relate to and go and use in the classroom. That inspired me to continue.
I: That was the experiences and education - and now I know at which school you teach ...
R: Yes, I'm very privileged - and I really take my hat off - there's teaching and teaching - and I've been very privileged in my life to teach children of the high calibre - and maybe I'd have a completely different outlook if I were put into a school where the children were hungry or the children were affected by abuse and that sort of thing. Our children are of a middle to upper class type of child - and it makes teaching a lot easier. I mentioned problems earlier on, but they are minor compared with what some teachers have to deal with. So I feel very privileged to teach in such a well run, well resourced school - and it makes teaching a pleasure. It has it's moments, but teaching always does.
I: And how many pupils do you have in your class?
R: There are about 27, but since I've been there - that's for 8 years - those numbers have fluctuated. When I started there were 34 to 36. It's gone down - I think one year I had 22. I suppose the average is about 28, which is very handleable. My classroom itself is a bit small for 34 , but considering that some of the teachers are teaching classes of 40 and 50, I can't complain.
I: And when you look at your class, do you what a lot of different mother tongue speakers in your own classroom or -
R: Yes, particularly in the last 8 years. Before that most of the children were English speaking. Some were Afrikaans speaking, but at the moment I've got English and Afrikaans and Xhosa and one of the girls has an Indian dialect that she speaks at home so there are a number of languages.
I: And how do you feel personally about having different mother tongue speakers?
R: I think I was terribly influenced by one of the higher order teachers, in that we were told from the beginning, when this integrated system started, that this was an English school and the children were to speak English and we were to encourage them to speak English. And I had that same viewpoint at that stage. But my opinion has changed and I think maybe through studies and seeing who the children are, how difficult it must be to try and converse, never mind study and understand, in a second or third language. Just, for example, sitting in groups and brainstorming. You know, one of the things we learnt, one of the modules was: why can't the children who are Xhosa speaking brainstorm in Xhosa? They have to do 2 steps. They have to think in their own mother tongue and then translate into English - and I've definitely changed my opinion, and we can learn from them. I
would love to learn to speak Xhosa. I hear the English first language children speaking and learning Xhosa when they have their lessons with a Xhosa speaking lady. And I'm actually quite jealous, because they know lots more than I do - and they are at a stage where they will soak it all in. But I don't think that in the past I've been as empathetic towards the children who have English as a second or even third language. I'm realising more and more that I need to understand where they are coming from.
I: You said you have a range of different languages - do you speak any of the other languages in the classroom?
R: Only Afrikaans.
I: And is it also a language - would you use it in the class if you have an Afrikaans girl?
$\mathbf{R}$ : Strangely enough I haven't done it to a large degree - maybe to a lesser degree. But I think it's so ingrown in me that one must speak the language of the school, which is English. And it's actually quite sad. I have used on occasions - and it's lovely to have children from another language - particularly like Afrikaans - it helps when we're teaching and the children are learning Afrikaans, to have the real, pure pronunciation from these little children - and they feel very special, like in the Xhosa classes as well, for them to give their knowledge in that situation. But when we're teaching in English, we don't always bring in a word from the vocabulary of another language. We talk about frogs - do I even know what a frog is in Xhosa? I know what it is in Afrikaans. Maybe that's the way I could learn and reinforce certain vocabulary in the children. But the changes must come and will come - but it's difficult when you're old at teaching.
I: You say you sometimes use a word with the pupils - if parents come to see you would you use it? Afrikaans words.
R: No, I wouldn't - I'd be very nervous.
I: What I was especially interested in ... after Apartheid, you don't have only English speaking schools, but it's more the norm that you might have mixed schools - different cultures and different languages in the classroom - and I mean ... has this also happened in your classroom, that you now have a different culture?
R: Yes, definitely. Two years ago we had a very interesting family - there were twins and they were Muslim and very religious. And because they wouldn't even eat some of the little cookies that other children brought because of their diet and the very strict Muslim religion. So we actually brought that into the classroom - and we had an opportunity - we invited the mother - she came and it was a wonderful opportunity for us to learn the culture of the Muslim people - and how they do their rituals and their beliefs.
We've also had Indian dancing at the school and Xhosa traditional dancing. Also there are certain games that the Xhosa children play. The children must be allowed to bring in those games. It's part of their culture - the games that their grandmothers and grandfathers played. They should feel free to bring in those specific areas of culture. So we do encourage it. When there is a Festival of Lights, we remind the children about that - and I think it's the Divali, when they bring their little sweetmeats and share them - and we talk about that. We've also done traditional bead making, where we invited a Xhosa lady to come and show the girls - and she actually dressed them up in different clothing with beadwork. Certain beads mean different things. If you're getting married, you wear one - and if you were in mourning, you'd wear another. So we try and use as much as we can - bring in the parents of the children in our class - to come and share their culture with us. And it's very important that the parent sees that they are accepted as they are - and for the child to see that their mother/father/granny have a part to play. With the traditional Xhosa bead making we also had a lady who was a white South African who did beads as a hobby and she came as well,so we could compare.

I: Do you feel that you have to change your way of teaching ... since you have multilingual classes?
$\mathbf{R}$ : Yes, definitely. I think that Apartheid culture is so ingrained ... was ingrained in our generation. But it definitely took time to even hug a black child, never mind kiss a black child - and it's now very natural for me - but it took a while. It's a very sad thing, because the children themselves don't see a colour difference. But it was always ingrained in our culture that they were different - but now we see them all the same.
I: And this whole thing about OBE and the way you teach language now? Since OBE has been introduced do you think it has also changed the way you teach language?
R: Yes, definitely. I think the outcomes based education has definitely allowed the stronger, more competent child to share her knowledge with the less competent one - and when they work in groups and they discover for themselves and there are one or 2 strong children within the group, the others (whether they are aware of it of not) are learning. They might be learning skills or pure language or vocabulary - they are definitely learning - and it also gives those children who are competent a feelilng of self satisfaction, that they have been able to lead a group, show their skills - and then it doesn't always happen that they are the leaders. We can have turns, where there is mixed ability - and then a Xhosa speaking group on their own, working together - and then one of them would become the leader. So there's a lot of interaction. It has changed my whole concept - and I believe that either when I go to a workshop - and even the modules that we've just done (repica?) - the time just goes so much quicker - you are more exited when you have participated - and so it must be for the little ones as well - rather than just sit and chalk and talk. It's far more advantageous all round. It's just very difficult to always, as a teacher and facilitator (more than a chalk and talk person) to be aware of what's happening in each group. It's difficult to find yourself in the spot where you are needed - and maybe in a place where you need to interject or add in or encourage.
You try and be all over in the groups - but sometimes it's difficult and when you turn your back maybe there's conflict or maybe an error. So I think it must be very difficult for inexperienced teachers. As an experienced teacher, you have ears and eyes as far as you can put them. But it is not always easy to facilitate and assess group work as a whole in the classroom. You are maybe assessing one particular aspect of one group, or some groups, but to assess all children in all aspects is really impossible.
I: And when we look at the language policy ... do you look at people with different languages when they are second language learners, what does -?
$\mathbf{R}$ : Yes, in the junior primary I think I can speak partly for them, in that we have Xhosa assemblies and in the past we've had (which have been very interesting) all the grade ones and twos and threes meet in the hall and then they do little plays and poems - and act out little things that they've learnt, using the vocabulary that they've learnt from the other children in the grade. I don't know if that actually happens in the senior primary. But it has made me think that we don't actually do that in Afrikaans, for example, which perhaps we should. We don't have an Afrikaans assembly, which we should. A lot of the people believe that Afrikaans is a dying language - but it is another representation in our school and maybe we need to look at that.
I: And what I'm interested in is: if I have a little child, and I want to bring the child to your school, and it will start off in pre-primary, and if it doesn't speak the language yet (in my family I would speak Afrikaans - or I would speak Xhosa) and my child doesn't yet speak the language, how does the school react? Is there anything like a language test?
R: Yes, they are tested. Eight years ago it was very different. I had a child in my class who came into my class and couldn't speak a word of English. And strangely enough, before that, when I was at the boys' school, I had a little boy from Germany who couldn't speak a word of English. He came in May. He was a very bright child. But it was such a
challenge for me. I first taught him to say when he needed the toilet. It was one of the highlights of my teaching, because that little boy was so bright, by September he was writing in English, better stories than half the class. And I would give him 10 to 15 minutes of my time per day and we had a box. Every day I took a box with a letter. So he was learning vocab and spelling of the objects in the box every day. He was just a remarkable child. And then a little girl who 8 years ago came to my class - just excelled so beautifully. She actually got a bursary from England for the high school last year. Maybe these are 2 unusual cases, but it just showed me how, through sheer determination and a certain amount of intelligence, they can and will strive in a school where their language is not the target language. But there have been cases of children who have struggled. And often they are in an English environment, they are hearing English for maybe 5 to 6 hours a day at school, correctly spoken, and they go home and their own family speak another language - or speak English incorrectly. One day I had a Mom say to me: "my child had very much fun today". Now that child is hearing her mother say "very much fun". That's just one error. If she's hearing that incorrectly at home, maybe there's not the apparatus or material to stimulate that child. A child can actually flounder. We have had cases where there isn't the stimulation at home, where the parents are not fluent in English. So what they are hearing at school is only part of their day - and it's not consolidated with anything at home. Sometimes they are better off at schools where they can speak their own tongue.
I: And if you do realise that there's a child who might not have developed the linguistic skills or the language as well as mother tongue speakers, how would you -?
$\mathbf{R}$ : We do provide better quality in the junior phases. We have lessons where we have to take them for language - and they have smaller groups. They also go for remedial language. I take the grade threes for language - and it's not just children whose mother tongue is not English. It can be English mother tongue speakers whose language is not fully developed. We take them in smaller groups - and we deal with themes and vocab and reading and comprehension and that sort of thing. So we do try as much as possible to encourage them to read. I think a child that is encouraged to read, sees and absorbs the written word and therefore can progress at a faster rate. But the children who suffer are usually the ones who don't have the reading skills and are not stimulated at home to read.
I: And then your own classroom - if you look at those who might be disadvantaged in their language abilities - how would you deal with linguistic (mistakes?)?
R: If it's a one-to-one, I would possibly correct them - if they asked me a question and there was an error - but I wouldn't do it in front of the class. I've also changed my mind totally with their creative work - and I've seen a huge improvement. I've just marked their creative work today. Because I was initially trained in senior grades, ...

R: Children in the junior phases are allowed to have this free flow of writing. And when I first got taught at grade 2 level I tried to change everything and correct everything and make sure they had proper sentence construction - and I do believe, with hindsight, that I was doing the children a huge disfavour, because they just saw red pen all over their wonderful stories. So the next time they wrote a story, they would come and check with me what the correct spelling was and if the sentence was correct - and it stilted their flow of writing. For 3 or 4 years - it has taken me that long to learn this. I have realised how important it is for them to have a free flow. It's fine, it doesn't matter about spelling, because when the thoughts are here, they must flow. In time, they will learn that correct spelling and sentence construction. But the content - and being able to put the language of their thought on paper is so vital. And I have seen in the last 3 years that I have changed my approach, the quality of writing is phenomenal. The stories that the children wrote for
me today, at the age of 7 and 8 years is phenomenal - because they have a news time, when they write news as well. There is no pressure - I'm just allowed to write my thoughts. And it has been a huge turnaround, for me as a teacher, to see that.
I: And obviously that is for all the children - their mother tongue speakers -?
R: Yes
I: And if you have a Xhosa or mother tongue speaker, do you take that into consideration as well, when you correct them, or not correct them?
R: No, I don't take that into consideration. They actually do very well. Because, 8 years ago, children were allowed to come into what we called a Model C school at any grade, where they are still allowed at any grade, a lot of them had maybe 3 or 4 years of grounding in a township school - and then slotted in like the child who eventually got the bursary. In our opinion, she didn't have a good, solid foundation. So she had gaps in her education. So that's why it was sometimes very difficult for a child to slot in to a grade in the fourth or fifth year of schooling, when she'd had a poor foundation. But the children that we teach, or have taught, in the last 3 or 4 years, have come right from the bottom - from the preprimary level - so they are getting exactly the same education (mother tongue and non-mother-tongue speakers) - the same foundation as the rest - and therefore they are keeping up. That's the difference compared with 8 years ago - when they slotted in and then floundered.
I: And all of a sudden they had to speak the language.
R: They had to speak the language - and had to do everything in English.
I: And you say you don't make a difference, whether it's a mother tongue speaker? Are there still sometimes situations where you think: "They would now know how to say this in Xhosa", that you would wish that you could speak their mother tongue - that you could just say it to them quickly?
R: Definitely.
I: And are there some ways that you try to overcome ... I try to explain it in English and the child just looks at me and doesn't understand me, are there ways of overcoming that?
R: Yes. A few years ago, when we had this situation, we used to use other children to explain.
I: That probably makes it (possible for you to) move on again?
R: Yes.
I: Now, coming closer to the end, one question that I find quite interesting - because I'm looking at multilingualism in the classroom - if you think of a multilingual teacher, what do you think would be an ideal multilingual teacher?
$\mathbf{R}$ : A teacher who is able to speak the language herself. And there are teachers (like that) and they must be a cut above the rest of us - who are able to speak Afrikaans, English and Xhosa fluently - and maybe even another language. There must be those out there. I think the children who were brought up on the farms in the Eastern Cape area - they were very fortunate, because they learnt from the workers on the farm how to speak Xhosa - and we actually have a number in our school at the moment. At least $20 \%$ of our staff can speak all 3 of those languages - and I think they are at a huge advantage - because they can then maybe just have the odd word or phrase or encouragement to that child, in her own language, which would be very special to that child. I went to one course at the Technikon to learn Xhosa, but unfortunately the teacher wanted to teach us grammatical things and comparisons to Sotho - and I was interested in conversational Xhosa - and still am. I said odd things to the class, that I've picked up - and they laugh, they love it - especially the Xhosa children.
I: And when you speak about doing language courses, what would equip a teacher to be this ideal? What would a teacher have to do?
$\mathbf{R}$ : Even in the module we've just done, when we spoke about a bilingual lesson, to me it wasn't purely bilingual. To me, bilingual means 2 languages - not just catering for children with another mother tongue. I did teach at a stage - it was very exhausting - a special class - a group of children who struggled academically. And they were 2 languages, English and Afrikaans. So whatever I said, I said in 2 languages. It possibly makes the child who is learning the target language lazy, because they will only want to hear their own. And in fact, I went to a school myself, when I was a child, where it was English and Afrikaans - and when the notices were in Afrikaans, I didn't listen to them. And so you can tune in to whatever language you are happy with and feel at ease with. So in a way, that would have advantages - and probably would have disadvantages, because the child who needs to learn, for example, English, and is having the teacher do her own Afrikaans in between is not going to learn the English. She's only going to focus on the Afrikaans. But I think there are ways. And again, we need to change and adapt to them, to bring in maybe vocab and phrases - not to translate everything, but maybe on a Wednesday we can use Xhosa phrases and on a Tuesday use Afrikaans phrases. The teacher would get her tongue around the phrases - and she could pick them up from the children. They are able to help you. They would love to help you. So a true multilingual teacher needs, in my opinion, to be very open. She's also going to make mistakes and struggle. At one stage I had to teach Afrikaans children in Afrikaans. I had to teach them geography. They helped me - and I wasn't embarrassed - I said "Thank you". Perhaps in the higher grades they are going to be unkind. But they will encourage the teacher, I am sure. So if we changed our focus to be multilingual, there are ways and means of doing it. And we would learn and grow ourselves through it.
I: And when we look at different ways of doing it ... additive bilingualism and how do you feel?
R: Because English is the language of power to a point - you know if you go through on the Internet, you are going to go through in English - there is just so much that is English. Even our parliament is speaking English. Our country is focusing towards English, being one of the International languages. If I was a Xhosa speaking parent, even though I knew that my child's own mother tongue and culture might suffer, for the benefit of him or her in the future, I would want her to have English as a first language in instruction. Because ultimately it's going to be a better life for her or him. I can maybe as the mother of a Xhosa speaking child try and instill the culture and whatever at home - but if I know that the instruction is in English and the child is being taught correctly in English in a school like I'm teaching at, I know it sounds harsh - but I would, as a Xhosa mother, do that. Because ultimately there is a better future for that child if she is totally fluent (competent) in English.
$\boldsymbol{P}:$ First of all, you mentioned your dual medium teaching experience - and it sounded like you were a learner - a pupil - in a dual medium ...
R: I was - and I taught. And I had to teach subjects in Afrikaans. I taught Afrikaans to Afrikaans children.
P: And you didn't repeat the sentences in English?
R: No. But in a special class situation I had to. In a special class of say, 20 children, 8 were English and 12 were Afrikaans speaking. So you had to cater for both. That was one post. I did relief work.
P: I'm very pleased that Randi's heard you talk about dual medium in South Africa. It would be interesting to compare that with what Heike is trying to do in terms of bilingual education. You and she might have further thoughts on that because you have sometimes taught in dual medium - taught in the other language. The second was that you've just mentioned in passing that the qualifications that you've taken - you've said that school
management skills were very helpful, insightful for you - and then also the language courses. Can you just comment a little bit about the language courses?
R: I think you are either a mathematical person or you're a language person. I'm certainly not a mathematical person. And strangely enough, as a child, I didn't do a lot of reading. In fact, I still don't do an awful amount of reading - but I love playing with words and language - and I'm fascinated by maybe the development of language. The one module was called something in language and teaching. I found that fascinating and it also gave me insight, for example, on process writing, which we don't deal with in schools. Where they write - and you can correct the odd one - and then they rewrite. We don't have time for that. Every week we are giving them a new theme and something else to write. And they don't actually see that as a (perfected?) thing ultimately that we would do. For example, when I type on the computer now, there will be a number of times before I actually hand in whatever I'm doing - because I'm checking and I'm changing. But we don't give the children that opportunity to check and change. Maybe even the one that they wrote today - if they looked at it themselves, they could find their own errors, if they sat with a buddy - maybe the friend could say "you've spelled that incorrectly", whatever. There just doesn't seem to be enough time to do what is natural in the real world - and that is where you check and change and ask someone's opinion and ultimately before you complete your task, you've looked at it a number of times and changed it. Even when you come back the next day sometimes, when you've written something, you (think) maybe I should have done it this way. We don't give the children that opportunity. We seem to get on to the next thing and the next thing - and we need to do that process right. When you learn it and you sit up and think "It's true - why don't we do this in teaching? It's what happens in the real world."
$\boldsymbol{P}:$ And then it's interesting the transition from what you said was a higher order thing about only teaching English and only using English, to your noting that some learners actually need to go through 2 steps ... which came first?
$\mathbf{R}$ : We were told, when I came to the school, this is an English school - and we will speak English and the children may not speak anything else to each other even in the playground, in the passages - they will speak English. And at that stage, 8 years ago, I said "Yes - they will speak English." Why on earth can't they speak their own language to their friends in the playground? Why on earth can't they say to their friend in the group: "I've got an idea - let's do it this way." Does it seem rude, because there is someone else in the group who doesn't understand them and may feel that they are talking about them? What about that poor child for whom it is a second language - and they have to think in their mother tongue and then translate? It's just going to make them introverted and inhibited. They should be allowed to - if you are going to brainstorm, thoughts must just flow. How can thoughts flow if you are restricting them?
$\boldsymbol{P}$ : So your reaction was, when you heard that instruction, almost immediately you responded in that way, feeling "this isn't right."?
R: No - in the beginning I thought "yes, yes." I accepted it - and then I thought "not on, not on."
P: What made you have this kind of insight and rebellion against that?
R: Because English was the way to go - and there must be purity - and they must hear it - and if, for example, 2 people in the group are not speaking the same language as the rest of us, we will feel that they maybe are trying to hide something, or talk about us. So it was a personal thing against the English in our particular school. They said "for educational reasons, you must let them speak English and they must practise it" - which had its merits. But ultimately, you are actually restricting the poor child who just wants to have a conversation with their friend and can't.

P: And then I found it very fascinating about the cultures and the assemblies and so on - and your successes with that German boy and the girl who got a bursary. Another significant shift seems to have happened with you when you used to "splatter things with blood", the way I used to, when you marked - and now you are really excited about the passion that they have when they are free to write their thoughts. The slotting in. That caused problems when you let children come in at grade 5 or 4 . What is the school's policy now, about that?
R: They are still allowed to come in, but they are tested to a point. We must see their level. We are probably doing the child a disfavour by allowing them to come into the school if they are not at the level that the rest of the children are at. It's not good for them at all. So they are tested to a point in their written work and their maths - not just language. And this happens across the board. It's not just, for example, Xhosa speaking - if we get a child from China or from England or wherever, we just give them the basic little test first to see how they slot in. If they are way behind, it's just going to be too difficult for them to slot in - so we suggest maybe a low level - and maybe they need to go to a school where the standards are not as high.
$\boldsymbol{P}:$ And also that you picked up that the dual medium is not ideal, because of the laziness and that rather you are working out ways to cater for the multilingualism - a day a week for the different languages Muslim mother - and her role is respected.
$\mathbf{R}$ : That is exactly what happened. She was looked up to. The children loved seeing her, because she came in to help out with books, etc - and they would say hello to her - and she felt very special.

I = Interviewer
$\mathrm{R}=$ Ruth
P = Professor

## Appendix 3 Interview with Jane

I: How long have you been a teacher?
J: Since 1973-29 years
I: And where and when?
J: I've taught all over the place. Started off in Port Elizabeth. Taught at Westering for 7 years. When I had children, I went out (to Lorint?). I filled in at all sorts of different schools. I've taught at private schools, boys only schools, girls only schools, mixed schools. We moved to Pietermaritzburg and I taught at some very wealthy schools and also at some very poor schools.
I: When you look at that, the different teaching experiences, was there something that was really satisfying for yourself?
J: Very. I'm going to miss teaching tremendously, because I find the children very, very rewarding.
I: You said that you have taught at quite different schools, quite different pupils, different backgrounds - is there something that you look back on and think: that was really -?
$\mathbf{J}$ : I think where I am at the moment - at Westering - is probably not perhaps the nicest experience, because you can get lots of perks at schools like Grey and Selbourne. Being a woman in a boys' school is very comfortable. I'm probably working harder than I have had to before. But I find what is so nice is having an input of young staff, that there is an energy about the school that is amazing. Whereas you get these state schools and you've got a pecking order - and we don't have a pecking order at all at Westering - anybody can come in as a first year and their ideas are just as important as somebody who has been there for 20 years. I find that very refreshing.
I: That was now the teaching experience. Now I'd like to ask you a few questions about the education and preparation for teaching you did. First question: where did you do your teacher training?
J: I went to Natal University and did a B.A. there - and also the U.E.D. there. Then a couple of years ago I decided that I needed something more - that I was getting ... teaching English and maths. And then of course, just because there was a shortage of maths teachers and an overabundance of English teachers 20 years ago, I moved into maths solely. I haven't taught English since then. But in about the early 1990s, I felt I was getting a bit stale. We were in East London at the time and I did an F.D.E. in computer studies. So I had another subject to teach, which was wonderful because I then went into computer studies - and did computer studies and maths for a good couple of years - and that was very refreshing. And I think that's why I've started with my Honours now. Because I just need something more. I'm getting a bit bored with teaching. Rather, I think that I'm losing my energy, my enthusiasm.
I: And when you look back at the different teacher training courses you've done - do you feel well prepared? When you first did your teacher education at Natal University, did you feel well prepared?
J: Don't be silly. Nobody taught us how to teach in universities in those days. We were merely thrown into the classroom with lots of pedagogics and sociology and psychology and - experience was the best teacher. It's certainly not like it is today. They hold their hand a lot more in the education department these days. And I like this learnership - I think that's a fantastic system. But we were certainly not prepared for high school teaching.
I: And when you say you've done quite a lot of further teacher qualifications - is there something that, when you look back, you find extremely helpful for your teaching situation now?

J: I like the research we've had to do. I find that very, very interesting. One gets to the stage where you can have enough theory. You've taught for so long and you think: I don't need somebody to tell me the theory of teaching - it's the practical I want. I want good ideas and different ideas. It's all very well saying: you must make teaching relevant. So teach me how to. I want practical things - and I think that's why the research has been fantastic, because you are actually interacting with children and you're gleaning things from them, as opposed to some guru telling you what to do.
I: When you say "research"?
$\mathbf{J}:$ We had to do quite a lot of hands on in the honours course - the science and the maths and also with the multilingual - each week we had a little project. We had to conduct little surveys and practical things, which I find was very useful.
I: Was there also something that you didn't find very helpful - or that you thought was rather a waste of time?
$\mathbf{J}$ : What was a waste of time was learning Turbo Pascal - and how to program in Turbo Pascal. It has now been chucked out of the syllabus - and they are now using Delphi. That was a bit of a waste of 2 years. But you can always use the principles. It's a bit like learning vector algebra and you never use it in the schools. No, I don't think there was anything that was useless - some a little more useful than others.
I: And when we look at your teaching situation right now, where are you teaching at the moment?
J: I'm at [...]
I: I know you don't have one classroom - you've got several classes, haven't you?
J: $\qquad$
I: In your classes, how many pupils are there in general?
J: Very varied. My matric class is 19 and my grade 9 class is 33 .
I: So there is quite a big difference, depending on the grades?
J: Yes.
I: And if you look at these classes, which mother tongues do you -?
J: Mainly English. Some Xhosa, but not a majority in the classes. You probably find that you have 6 or 7 that are not English speakers. Although, a lot of them - we must clarify mother tongue English, but it's not pure English. A lot of the coloured folk speak almost a dialect, would you say? Their English is very, very different in their homes - from the English that we teach at school. So they find as much difficulty, I think, learning the theory of maths, because it's a foreign language to them. They've got nothing to hook their knowledge on - there are no terms that they use that are ... they have a mishmash of English and Afrikaans - and that is their mother tongue.
I: How do you feel personally about having all these different mother tongue speakers in one class?
J: Well, we don't cater for them. I think that's the saddest thing of all. I can't cater for them, because I speak English all the time. I can explain and paraphrase, but I can't speak Xhosa. Basically the philosophy of the school is "we're an English medium school - if you want to come here, please make sure you're proficient in English." But of course, that doesn't mean to say that ... they've got just conversational English - and we've got to fill in from there.
I: And when you say you don't speak Xhosa, do you speak any of the other mother tongues like Afrikaans?
J: I understand it and I can speak it, but we don't speak it in class.
I: So you wouldn't use it with the learners if you have the sort of idea that this person, this pupil, doesn't understand, you wouldn't try to translate things into Afrikaans ...?
$\mathbf{J}:$ No. We did this survey last year - and I was surprised. I think that at Westering there is something like ... an amazingly small number - out of about 850 pupils - I think there were
something like 30 Afrikaans mother tongue pupils. So it doesn't come up often, particularly because of the juxtaposition of Framesby, which is an Afrikaans medium school, which is only just across the road. So the people who come to Westering want English - otherwise they would have chosen Framesby. Because Framesby is an excellent school - it has probably got a better standard of education than Westering. So they wouldn't have chosen Westering over Framesby for any other reason than to learn English. So it doesn't come up that we have an Afrikaans speaker that is not at all capable of speaking English.
I: And what I found very interesting is looking back in the history of South Africa and looking at 1994 and the end of Apartheid - and now the norm would be to have mixed schools - have different languages, different cultures, different races - and obviously when you describe your classrooms or grades - that has also happened at your school?
J: Yes. I have no idea what the - it's probably between $35 \%$ and $45 \%$ black students to $55 \%$, $60 \%$ white students.
I: And when you now think about all the different mother tongue students you now have in your class, did it mean for you, as a teacher, that you had to change ways of your teaching?
$\mathbf{J}$ : Not necessarily - particularly in the subject of maths. If you have to explain what a derivative is, you've got to explain it to an English person as well as try and think of examples so that you can make it more relevant to them. So you are simplifying the language anyway, to try and explain. It's not like teaching geography or history, where you are speaking English, but you speak in a higher plane. You've got to define everything and speak in quite simple language, to get those concepts across. I am more aware of speaking simply, but I'm also very aware that you can't talk down - and I'd far rather that the query came from them - and that's why we sit in groups. Because then I find that they can ask each other, rather than asking in the class. But mostly, the senior students don't mind asking. They don't get embarrassed.
I: ... asking for a word if they don't understand?
J: "Miss, I don't understand!"
I: And what I obviously also find quite interesting is ... everybody is now talking about OBE and my coming from a different country - and thinking that it has changed quite a lot-this whole concept of OBE. Do you find it has influenced your own way that you teach language - or how you handle language in the classroom?
$\mathbf{J}$ : Not necessarily. OBE is a way of teaching in the sense of knowing where you're going before you start. Previously, we'd have the text book and we'd whip through the text book in the year - and we'd be syllabus-bound. Now we're not syllabus-bound - we're only outcomes- bound. And we must know what the outcomes are and know how we are going to assess it before we even look at what content we are going to be doing. So in that way it's a radical change as far as teaching goes. As far as using the language goes, the situation is the same. In maths we still got to define and speak simply - and you deal with a lot of misconceptions. So we are very aware of misconceptions. And I suppose one is more aware, teaching maths, of how you use the language.
I: And you spoke a bit about having different mother tongue speakers - but is there some policy, if speakers of other mother tongues should come to the school?
$\mathbf{J}$ : The policy at our school is that it's an English medium school and you must have some modicum of conversational English. They don't provide intervention courses - and that's why poor old Ronald got dumped - and he just sank or swam - and he's swimming very nicely, thank you. We do have some other Taiwanese children who are really battling. They don't have English skills. And the school is saying, basically, this is an English medium school. If you can't cope, you'll have to find an outside tutor to help you. It's quite rigid in that sense.

I: So there's no written rule to say we need to look after these children when they come with deficient language skills - we have to help - and there's no - they have extra classes or extra English or second language classes?
J: No - nothing like that.
I: So if you then still have children like this Taiwanese boy, he comes into your class obviously he was accepted, but his English is not as good as that of a mother tongue speaker. How would you then deal with it in the class?
$\mathbf{J}:$ He has one of those wonderful little computers, in which you put the English word and out comes the Taiwanese word. So he does his own little dictionary work. But - put him in groups - we've found out who he sort of related to and could communicate with - and they work very much in a group. So that he was comfortable - and he is able to ask his peers not necessarily in so many words, but point to and - you know. They've got their own way of communicating with him - and he has the most wonderful sense of humour. He jokes all the time. And he will come up to me often with his broken English and competitive. Don't dare do him out of a mark - he'll come and challenge. So communication-wise we're doing OK. Whether he's learning much English in my class, I don't know - but he's learning a lot of mathematical terms. And it's not necessarily going to help him conversationally, but it'll certainly help him mathematically - because he's got that background - a very good mathematical brain. So he seems quite happy.
I: Also in mathematics, it's a lot of symbols. I remember reading that you don't need so many words - you do in a way, but you can also do a lot of -
J: Absolutely. He understands exactly what I'm trying to get at. So it does make it easier.
I: And when you say you teach a content subject and they might also be mother tongue speakers, but maybe second language learners - and when they communicate with you, or between each other, are there moments when you also focus on their language, when you correct mistakes?
J: I don't. I find that it's a bit harsh to correct their mistakes. If they are using something grammatically incorrectly, then I try and use the correct ... but I don't ever say to them: "That was wrong - now you should say it this way." Unless, of course, it is a totally unacceptable word or expletive, which often comes out. You sometimes choose to ignore it and sometimes you don't. But I certainly don't correct their grammar. Now, for example, when Ronald comes and talks to me - the mere fact that he's coming to talk, it's not for me to correct him. My job is to understand what he's saying - and I will say to him "Do you mean this - or do you mean that?" And he will then be able to say yes or no. So I will paraphrase what he is saying, but I am not correcting what he is saying. He must just pick up the inference from there.
I: When we spoke about a teacher being able to speak the mother tongue - do you sometimes feel that you wish: "If I could now ..."?
J: Absolutely. I'd love to - but I am utterly useless with languages. I can't get my mouth around the clicks. They laugh at me all the time.And, of course I'm using the wrong click in the wrong place. It's a great pity and it's perhaps historical that we never learnt the African languages.
I: So are there certain situations in which you think it would be extremely useful to know the mother tongue?
J: Absolutely - but unfortunately it's not important enough for me to move my butt and do something about it. I should, but I'm not.
I: And if you realise that there's some kind of communication problem - that they look at you with big eyes and they are not really sure?
$\mathbf{J}: \mathrm{Oh}, \ldots \mathrm{Oh}$, absolutely. They can talk in whatever language they want to - as long as they are dealing with the subject at hand. And sometimes I wish I knew what they were talking
about, but you can certainly tell whether they are on the topic or not. Their body language and their tone of voice can tell you whether they are chatting or not.
I: So looking back for a moment at what you said about the language policy at the school, it's something quite OK if they are in the lesson and that your group will have to use their mother tongue?
J: Oh, yes. As long as they stick to the topic. But they can be talking English and still be off the topic - so that's got nothing to do with the languages. And often you find that they explain to each other in Xhosa.
I: Are you a bit sensitive to "are they really speaking about that" or if they are laughing about something - you realise they might have changed -?
J: Absolutely. Just their facial expressions. That doesn't have to be the language. You can look across the classroom and you can tell whether they are concentrating or whatever.
I: And when you now look at teaching in multilingual classrooms and having different mother tongue speakers and mixed classrooms, mixed schools - if you would have to give some kind of definition, what is an ideal multilingual teacher?
J: One who can understand the languages in the class of your students.
I: And would it only be to be able to speak the languages or -?
$\mathbf{J}$ : No, you would need to understand what's behind them. I find it fascinating that so many people go to ... young teachers go to Taiwan or Japan or wherever to teach English. To try and find something of relevance that would interest them, you just have to know their background and their culture and what makes them tick. And the taboo subjects.
I: What would equip a teacher to be this ideal multilingual teacher? You say that students go overseas - do you think there would be other things that would be helpful to become?
J: Obviously, the courses. Like we've done now. I think perhaps those sort of courses should go straight into the teacher training. I think there should be something at the first level teacher training - particularly in South Africa. Because one has to be aware of all the things that we've been learning about. And it's pointless only touching the honours and masters students. It's too late then, because generally those people are moving out of the nitty grit of teaching.
I: And when you look at the course - how hard it was to get enough people, because you think "Why don't we have more people on the course?" - but then it's sort of thinking it's only for masters students - if there are not enough masters students.
J: Absolutely.
I: And this is, I think, also a topic that should really interest everybody - the same as in Germany, they now teach students how to teach German as a second language - because it's just an issue that is coming up-and that teachers need to be aware of.
J: Absolutely.
I: Now let's speak about that one course - were you looking back at it and when you think: "We really need courses like that" - did you find what you expected in that course?
$\mathbf{J}$ : Yes, I did. I found there was quite a lot of repetition. Bev uses Cummins's work a lot and I found that I had already been open to all those ideas. It was very good. I just feel we should target all first year teachers. I think that's where you need the course - not, perhaps, at a high level - but there's nothing that they can't handle. They need to be aware of this sort of thing - and of the strategies that one uses. And I think that's very, very useful - this is how you do (it) in this situation - and just open it to more people, because I think it's essential. And particularly to the teachers that are in in-service training - that would be absolutely fantastic.
I: Because then they would have the practical side to it as well - because they would be in the classroom. I don't know whether they do that here - that they go to the school, teach ?
J: Yes.

I: At the same time do the education at the university - but they could really combine it in a way - and it wouldn't only be theory, but be something useful for them?
J: Very much so. Because I was disappointed that it was so small. I thought it would be a much, much bigger course. I expected 30 to 40 people to be interested.
$\mathbf{J}:$... the topic we did was logarithms - and I would have taken the whole concept - not just one lesson. And how would I have got this through to a multilingual class - and used written work and scaffolding - thought of ways of doing it.
I: Also because of limited time, obviously ...
J: Yes.
I: Because I also had the feeling now people are sitting at home, planning their lesson plan and then they come back, but we don't have any chance of really talking about it presenting it to each other - and saying what's good about it, what can be improved - what I might like to do in my own lesson plan ... there seems to have been one session missing at the end.
J: Yes.
I: Things could have come together ...
$\mathbf{J}:$ Yes, to be discussed. I found it very useful doing that lesson plan, too, together. That was very nice because we picked up ideas fro each other - things I wouldn't have thought of. Of course, that synergy is very good. But I would have liked to have developed that a little more - and then ended up with something - as you wanted to do. Implement it. And perhaps, in stead of when you come to the schools, just taping the lesson for transcription, we should tape the lesson that we've implemented - that we've planned, should I say.
I: When you look at a multilingual classroom and the situation has been changed, with mixed schools, how do you feel about additive bilingualism?
J: I'm very ambivalent about the whole thing. Whereas had I, perhaps, from grade 8 to whatever, gone into a parallel medium school ... although I was in a dual medium school and I taught in a dual medium school for years. Even then, there wasn't very much contact between the children. There were the Afrikaans speaking children, there were the black children and there were the English speaking children - and it was amazing that they did not socialise very much. The kids aren't political, but I think it's just a case of where they are most comfortable. Keeping together. Total submersion doesn't work either, because you have to be credibly intelligent to cope. And we don't want to deal only with intelligent people - we've got to deal with everybody. It will work for some people - it depends how that second language is presented. You have to want to learn it. I know I have a need to learn Xhosa, but my want isn't big enough to make me actually do it. Perhaps that's what we have to engender in these kids - a need. Unfortunately, with English being powerful, we have this feeling that we don't need to learn other people's languages - because they'll talk our language anyway. I know that's an awful attitude to have, but that's how it is in South Africa, at least.
$\boldsymbol{P}:$ So - the honours course - that idea was also being promoted, wasn't it - the idea that the first language must be maintained?
J: Absolutely.
P: So theoretically you've been told that in 2 courses - but you still feel ambivalent about it?
$\mathbf{J}$ : The theory is perfect, but I just don't know if it's right in South Africa. I know that our black students must learn in their mother tongue. And this business of changing them over in grade 2, or whatever it is, is ridiculous. I just know that we've got to have more support in English teaching that we aren't giving these children. It's no good giving them half an hour, once a day, and expecting them - by the time they write matric - to be able to speak that language. That's basically what we had. Now we call that "additive bilingualism", but it wasn't - because we actually never had a situation where we spoke colloquially to Afrikaans people. We had a teacher who taught us the vocab - and in
strange situations ... and we talked about going shopping and my holiday - this stilted sort of environment. And I'm just very worried that we're getting the same situation here - that what we call "additive bilingualism" acually isn't at all. You're getting a history lesson or geography lesson ... it's just another lesson - it's not really helping you to communicate. I think our langauge teaching - particularly second language teaching, if it's Afrikaans in an English school or third language teaching, which is mainly vocabulary and basic sentence structure. We need more teaching like the courses they have - how to teach Taiwanese children - what do they call those courses?
$\boldsymbol{P}$ : English as a foreign language.
J: Yes - those sort of courses.
P: They're very communicative and purpose-oriented/ functional ...
J: That's what we need.
P: ... authentic - the kind of terms that came up in this module as well, like "authentic", "information gap" - all those sorts of things are practised in those kind of "English as a foreign language" courses - they're exciting and fun. There are motivated adult learners, and there's also a lot of activity and doing and role playing and so on. But you're quite right - second language and third language teaching is done rather badly by mother tongue speakers of those languages ... you know - and the emphasis is often on learners' making mistakes in grammar.
$\mathbf{J}$ : Absolutely. Learning those lists - just so that you could slot in the correct preposition.
P: We really need to impact the way second and third languages are taught - and, as you say, such modules should start lower down than the honours.
J: Yes.
P: And just one last observation I want to make - we've just been with Heather - both of you were at dual medium schools as pupils and you both taught for a number of years in dual medium schools... and she was also rather negative about it - and felt that the learners would become lazy and just wait for their Afrikaans or English to come up ... And yet that might have seemed to be an ideal kind of bilingual education, but -
$\mathbf{J}:$ No, it didn't. We need a different type of intervention altogether. And in our schools we need Xhosa to be taught right the way through - almost as we have with the new OBE we have to teach arts and culture for 10 hours and life orientation for 10 hours a week. Now that to me is where we must be teaching a second language - in that sort of fun way. That, to me, is the ideal opportunity. But we have to have teachers that can do it.
P: ... a school policy thing about teachers who can do that - who can teach it well ...
J: Yes.
P: So you would suggest, for example, in teaching maths, people throughout South Africa, anyway, tend to use English - because numbers in other African languages are often difficult.
J: Yes.
P: So - English is repetitive in maths.
J: Yes.
P: But you say arts and culture, to be fun, could be done in the second language.
J: Absolutely. And where it's not dependent on the language as to whether you'll pass or fail. You don't have a written assessment, or whatever. You could do so much in those sort of other subjects - where assessment is conversational - make a little play - act out the play take some folk lore and that sort of thing. You could do quite a lot there, but nobody is going to.
$\boldsymbol{P}:$ Maybe our image should - because it's called "language and arts education - we combined language education with arts ... and I think (they're having?) good value in ...
J: I didn't do her arts and culture course.

P: No - but she (Delport?) is going to offer a Masters module. That's what Mike Barry wants to do. So if we could link that to a second language medium - arts and culture that could be fun
$\mathbf{J}$ : Yes. And bringing in some more of this teaching English as a foreign language. Those sort of concepts - to make it fun. We can encourage more teachers who are going to be teaching English in that way. Like (Lulama?), for example.

I = Interviewer
J = Jane
$\mathrm{P}=$ Professor

## Appendix 4 Interview with Lydia

I: Few questions on teaching experience - how long have you been a teacher?
L: 24 years.
I: Where and when?
L: Started teaching at David Livingstone and I'm still there.
I: A specially satisfying time?
L: I really enjoyed it when I started teaching there. It was quite exciting, compared to what we have today. When we started it was more exciting and fulfilling.
I: Preparation and education - where teacher training?
L: (?) Training College for 2 years - got a (?) teacher's certificate - then I went to college in Cape Town, called (?) Training College - there I specialised in home economics - and after that I furthered my studies - I did a (?) teacher's diploma in academic subjects - and after that I did a B.A. degree through Unisa - and after that a computer course at UPE and then B.Ed.(Hons).
I: Did you feel you were well prepared for the job?
L: Yes.
I: Were you especially well prepared in that training
L: I feel I was well prepared at college, because I specialised in the subject and I knew that I was going to teach that subject.
I: (Of your further courses,) What do you feel was most helpful?
L: I would definitely say the computer course.
I: Is the honours course helping you?
L: The B.Ed.(Hons) course helped me in other fields as well. I think that ... I don't teach home economics as such. Last year I taught a language for the first time - and with this OBE now, it was really interesting to know that there are other avenues that you can explore as well - if you teach a language, for instance, everything doesn't have to be grammatically correct. You feel that you can use the children's language as well. That's what I found most interesting.
I: Any qualification which you feel was not very helpful - a waste of time?
L: No - I think everything really helped me.
I: Now your current teaching situation. You don't have one class - you have several classes and they always come into your class - and they stay with you?
L: Yes, for a period of 55 minutes they stay.
I: What grades?
L: This year I'm teaching grade 8,5 classes of 46 children each - and one class of 43 children in grade 9 .
I: Your pupils - I know you have Afrikaans mother tongue speakers, but do you have other mother tongue speakers as well?
L: Yes - Xhosa speaking.
I: How do you feel ... David Livingstone used to be only an Afrikaans speaking school - how is it to have different mother tongue speakers in the class as well now?
$\mathbf{L}$ : It is difficult for the children, I suppose, seeing that Afrikaans is not their first language and it's frustrating for the teacher as well. Because you don't know whether they always understand you - and the feedback that you sometimes get ... you don't know whether they understand what's going on.
I: And do you speak Xhosa?
L: Yes, I speak a little conversational Xhosa and I understand it as well.
I: If you have the feeling in class that you don't know whether they really understand, would you use Xhosa in class to the pupils - or maybe if the parents come to see you?
L: Only on a conversational level, but not on a teaching level.

I: Now, after the Apartheid era, they have mixed schools - rather than only English speaking schools or only Xhosa schools - so they are all mixed. When you say that you now have Xhosa speaking children in your class, obviously that has also happened at David Livingstone. Coloured and black children. To what extent does this happen?
L: There are quite a few now (meaning black children?).
I: Does having a mixed school now make changes to the way you teach in your classes?
L: Definitely it means you must make changes to your classes in terms of your language, in terms of how you address the pupils - seeing that you have different cultures as well in your class.
I: Does OBE have any consequence for the way you use language with the pupils?
L: I don't teach languages as such.
I: How you use language with the pupils (regarding $O B E$ )?
$\mathbf{L}$ : There is a change in how you use language, because it doesn't mean that you just have to use Afrikaans. You can use English words as well, just to explain to them. Most of them know (... things) and they don't know the Afrikaans for that. If you use the English word, they will know exactly what you are talking about.
I: How does the school react if the pupils aren't fluent in Afrikaans yet?
L: Our school doesn't have a language policy yet. We are an Afrikaans speaking school and if the pupils come there and their mother tongue is something else, the policy at this stage is still Afrikaans.
I: If I come to your school and my Afrikaans is not good, do I need to do a test?
L: No.
I: So if they don't speak Afrikaans very well, do they still have a chance to attend your school?
$\mathbf{L}$ : Well, if they come from other Afrikaans schools - because some of them go to the (family?) schools and if they come from those schools, we usually take them. But if we see that the child really has a language problem, then we rather ask the parents to come and we ask the parents to put them into an English school.
I:How do you deal with children in the class who are second language learners? Do you teach them differently in a way?
L: This is very difficult, because you can't put 46 children in a class - you can't give those children special attention. You need to finish your work. You try to help them.
I: Would the pupils be allowed to use their mother tongue in class?
L: Yes - I do allow them, because sometimes if they don't understand something, those who understand will explain to them in their mother tongue. For me, it's not a problem, as long as they understand what is expected of them.
I: Other teachers wouldn't say "don't do it"?
L: No.
I: If they struggle with the language and they make mistakes, how would you deal with it? Would you treat them differently from mother tongue speakers?
L: The numbers make it difficult. You try to explain to them and give them the correct words and explain how to use them - but in terms of individual attention, it's difficult.
I: Is there something like second language classes at your school - Afrikaans classes where they can improve their reading or writing skills?
L: No. We have problems in terms of that, because those kids aren't staying near the school. They have to travel distances to get to school - so it's difficult for them to stay after school.
I: You can speak conversational Xhosa. Are there times when you'd like to speak Xhosa and just tell them straight away?
L: Yes.
I: What kind of moments would they be?

L: If you feel that the child really doesn't understand the instructions or the content or you as a teacher.
I: You say that the students are allowed to speak to each other in Xhosa, that's one way to overcome the communication problem - are there other ways.
L: The other learners - Afrikaans speaking - also help them. Because some of them come from the same primary schools. They know each other and I suppose they know that some of them have difficulty with the language and they try to encourage and help them as well.
I: Do you use dictionaries?
L: In the language classes, they do.
I: But not so much in the content subject classes?
L: No
I: I want in my research to look at the multilingual teacher. Do you have an idea about what would be an ideal multilingual teacher?
$\mathbf{L}$ : An ideal multilingual teacher would be fluent in the languages. For instance in the Eastern Cape it's important to be able to speak Afrikaans, English and Xhosa. That's an ideal situation. As I say, in the Eastern Cape. But if you go to KwaZulu Natal, for instance, you have to speak Zulu instead of Xhosa. So it depends on where you are.
I: You say that's your idea of a multilingual teacher. How do you feel you can be best prepared for that? If you look at teacher training courses, how do you fee you can prepare for being such a multilingual teacher?
L: I think it's a difficult one, because at college - and I suppose at university as well - the languages they use are either Afrikaans or English or both. But they don't really introduce Xhosa at that level. But some of the schools do have Xhosa as a subject. So it's better for those children to start learning Xhosa at an early age - and to be able to speak the language and understand and carry on with it. But to go to college or university - to be part of that training - I don't know whether that is possible. But it is necessary and important.
I: To be able to speak the language, obviously you have to do language courses. You talked about Honours and other modules - would you say that it's also something that helps you to be more aware?
L: Yes - definitely.
I: We spoke about additive bilingualism, where you have the mother tongue that you maintain and then only when you have the basis of the mother tongue, that you learn a second language. How do you feel about additive bilingualism? Do you think it's a good way to go or is it going the wrong way?
L: I think that it is a good way to go - so that you know your mother tongue as a first language and then you can learn a second or third language after that..
I: These are all my questions I had on my paper.

I = Interviewer
L = Lydia

## Appendix 5 Interview with Sarah

## I: How long have you been a teacher?

S: It's eight years. Started in April 1994.
I: Where and when did you teach?
S: In the same school.
I: You told me you have been in a different building for quite some time, you only moved into that ...
S: It was an old building, there were cracks, when it was raining it was full of mud. And I was teaching four grades in one class, a small classroom. Not a normal classroom. And with four grades you separate your learners by grouping them in different desks. Maybe a little space between the desk. And in group work you take one grade, and then the other grades prepare activities. It can be free work or it can be reinforcement on the previous lessons. So right now I'm teaching one grade, but last year I was still teaching two grades.
I: And the grade you are teaching now...
S: ...that is grade 2.
I: And when you look back.. you said you have been teaching about eight years. And when you look back at your teaching experiences is there something that was really really good. Or that was especially satisfying for you as a teacher, if you look back at these eight years.
S: If I look back I was not real as good because of the background of my training, also the background of the system when I was a scholar. Anyway I went to Cape College of Education which had a better lecturers. I learned something from them but it was not enough for the teaching experiences. So it was tough because there was nothing, there was no work done, nothing in the classroom, it was just the walls. So I had to develop personally the classroom in terms of putting nice pictures and to build that [...] atmosphere for the learners otherwise learners wouldn't move in, they escaped. So that was the start of my teaching. And then we started with the in-service training meaning attending the workshops. There were too many workshops, so much that you were not [..] of what you were doing. But until, should be 1999, I got a big picture. So I used what I've learned from those workshops. But now in a big picture I know exactly what I want to be. Take only the things that I think are important in my teaching. And we had coordinators whom we would have [...] when we needed help for our lessons, whom visit our classroom and then we talk so much about our learners. So we had that support from them. And in fact when you look back I can't even look on the planning booklet I started to using. It's totally different. And creativity is on thing that I've learned as a teacher. Before I started teaching, one belief in programs, to use a program that is build by other people, and those people know what they are doing, but you follow something that you don't know. But right now I'm not using any program. I'm developing my lessons and I focus on my creativity and it must be always relevant to the level of the learners. So that the difference of now and then.
I: So you would say that now is definitely a lot more satisfying for you, for yourself as a teacher.
S: Mmmh. And we're focusing on outcome-based. So you do what is good for you. Not what the [...] made once for you.
I: You already said a bit about where you did your teacher education. Where was that? Where did you do your teacher training?
S: I was trained in junior primary teaching. And I can teach from grade one to grade seven. But it was relevant from grade one to great four.

I: And that was, did you say in Cape Town...
S: No, it not in Cape Town, it's in Eastern Cape, next to Alice where [...]. It's a neighbouring town. It's a training college. The difference with our college with other colleges... some colleges, they don't have boarding. So we had hostels and you said there for a term. And even the outcome, if you, can meet some teachers who are coming from the same college, you'll still have teachers, because we work hard, we were in the same, we were sharing same buildings. And when we're teaching we are very [...] unlike people who were staying home and not sharing with other people.
I: And you said that you felt not really well prepared when you started teaching because of the background and of the system. Are you saying that when you started teaching you didn't feel well prepared to actually teach when you became a teacher or how did you feel about that?
S: I was not confidently enough but that I had that feeling that I can do it as long as I know exactly what I should do. And I've realised, because our coordinators are white teachers who were teaching before. And they are multi-skilled, and fortunately they were teaching the same grades with us. So there was a lot of information they wanted to show us. But because of that teacher it was not easy for us to cross the bolting (?) until you've got that big picture and then realise this is what, JoAnne, if I can mention, she used to tell us about. But now it's because through my studies I'm thinking different. And I'm always focusing, I'm always applying what I'm taking from my university studies. So it's different now.
I: So you have done a teacher training course at the teacher college and now you are doing further qualifications or more qualifications ... what you do at U.P.E., or you've done your B.Ed Hons. If you can tell me...
S: I've got that junior teacher's diploma. I went for further diploma in education through the university of Natal for two years. Then after that I went for the B.Ed in teacher education for Honours through U.P.E. So now I'm doing my Master's Education at U.P.E.

I: And when you look at all the courses you have done or modules or extra qualifications, is there something were you say that was really really helpful for me?
S: Oh yes, oh yes. Most modules in both universities - at university I've done school improvement, school management, school effectiveness. And there was a good module about partnership between education and business. And it was about systems. So I started to know better about education as a system. And further I started to understand what management is. And how do you get a school that is very effective through those modules. And also U.P.E., it was similar, I've also done school improvement, school management. What I learned through the two universities, they had same modules, but in different ways of approach. So it was not a repetition of what I had done in Natal. It was a new approach. And the one in Honours was very applicable because as you know that at school we had projects. When I was tackling those modules, they maybe they will ask me to use a [...] and take any program or project in [...] developing my school. I didn't plan for the projects because projects are already there. It's only I had to apply, and it must be applicable to the spint (?) that I'm asked to apply. So it was only a paperwork more than thinking of how can I make a book for the school. So I've realised as well that it's about doing the right thing. If the modules are telling me about the development of the school and in the same way that we're doing, the we are in the right track. Then I confirm to my project coordinator we're in the right track. Then I started to ask her how did you get this teacher. And she said to me, it's not a big picture, it's something that grows. It's relevant to your module, and I didn't know that we were working towards it.

I: And also, now you described what you found very helpful. Are there also things, extra qualifications or courses you did where you think that was a bit of a waste of time or not very helpful?
S: Not really. I mean the principal course. And I mentioned to you that we had seven farm schools, and now we are in the central school. So had seven principals applying for the principal post for the new school. So I'm different from other people because I learned the different schools through my modules. And there were key studies whom I always relate to my school. And I've learned that most principals, they learned... they upgrade their qualifications because of the status. Not because of sharing what they learned or developing at their schools. So I've learned a lot, especially in the management modules.
I: I know have a few questions about your current teaching situation. Where are you teaching at the moment?
S: I'm teaching in Tarkastad. Tarkastad is in the northern cape of Eastern Cape. And the school, it's 25 km from Tarkastad. So it's on the way along [ ...]. So it's a rural, but it's a collection of schools. Then we've got a Winterberg School Trust, which was formed by farmers with their entries (?). Because before there were no schools, and the little ones had to leave their homes to get studies. So they decided to concentrate on the development of the schools.
I: And it's also quite a special school in that...
S: It's a special because as I was saying they started developing teachers ... teacher development program. After we realised we'd been skilled but there were still some obstacles that makes the learning not to blow. Then we thought of developing the community because parents are illiterate. And the problems we had before, it's like high rate of absenters, because the parents don't see the value of educating their learners. And also there was a problem of distance. Some learners were walking for more than 20 km , some more than 50 km . But because of the help from the Winterberg School Trust we overcome those problems. And right now we are a school with a community, because we've got a community projects. So meaning that you are sharing same resources for the parents. And in name that my teaching now is kind of simpler because I'm meeting a parent two times a week than before. Before there was no communication. And parents know nothing about what was in the school. But now we've got that bond between parents and the teachers, also teachers and learners. Because as learners they know that the teacher knows their parent. They started to behave.
I: You have already said you teach in a grade two. How many pupils are in your class?
S: About 14.
I: Quite a small class.
S: In fact even in that small class I'm still teaching group work, cooperative teaching because [...]
I: And in your grade 2, do you have different mother tongue speakers? Or are they all Xhosa?
S: I do have one Afrikaans speaker but the Coloreds are not using the language even in the class. I'm sure it's because of the geographic background. The farm might have one family of Coloreds, and then that family will have to compromise to use the language that is in the majority.
I: Are you able to speak Afrikaans?
S: Mmh-mmh, it's not a language that I use. But I've done it at school and also for my training.

I: And obviously there is just the one boy. Do I understand it right that he is actually Afrikaans mother tongue speaking, or has his family also decided that they also speak Xhosa in the family because they live in this Xhosa speaking area.
S: The mother speaks Afrikaans. But I don't know what is going on after school. I don't want to maybe. But what I know, you can't differentiate that child from Xhosa children.
I: You said you have been teaching for eight years, when you started teaching did you have in your class only Xhosa mother tongue speakers in the beginning?
S: In the beginning it was only Xhosa.
I: And how do you feel now with having different mother tongue speakers in your class?
S: I'm not feeling threatened or I'm not feeling unhappy because first of all in grade 2 only focussing two languages, that is Xhosa and English. And English, it's not that much, it's just communication skills. So really for me to learn more about the language, it's not something that I'm going to apply in the classroom when I'm teaching.
I: And if you say, you learned a bit of Afrikaans at school. Would you use ever use it with the pupils in the classroom.
S: I never use it. Even in eight years back.
I: And you wouldn't also use it to the parents, or...no...
S: Parents are communicating with my mother tongue. So it's not that, they use the language, I mean Xhosa, as an official language, it's like a mother tongue to them. Cause they couldn't [compete?]
I: That was your teaching experience and your teacher education, where you are teaching at the moment. What I find interesting, looking at my what I'm going to do in my research. I find it interesting, since the end of Apartheid you have mixed schools now. It used to be only black schools, only white schools or colored schools, Indian schools. And I find it very interesting that...
S: $\quad$ So white education for all.
I: $\quad$ So now it's mixed schools and as you say when you started teaching it might have only been Xhosa speaking children or black children. And now you can also have colored children. So that has also happened at your school that you have mixed schools. Did this mean for you that when you have now ... obviously it is different when this little boy or little girl comes to your school and can already speak Xhosa, it's different, but it did it mean for you that having different children of different cultures, did it mean that you had to change your teaching in a way when you realised there are ... I mean did it mean that you changed the way you teach the children or ...?
S: I'm not really sure because ....
S: $\ldots$ the special child. Because I've done one module on [...] education. In the [...] all learners learn in one class and they've got different ways of learning. Some, they are learners with special needs. So I'll take this case like the one that one needs a special way of doing things. Then my approach will change, definitely. Because it is not about teaching, it is about teaching and learning. I learned from them, and they learned from me. So definitely my teaching will change.
I: But with this little boy in your class, he is so fluent in Xhosa that you...
S: So much that I don't even think that he is Afrikaans. He has struggled before. And then I started to send work at home. And then he's got an August place. And then I explained to him how we work, and he improved.
I: So there is a bit of, you need to change ...
S: You need to close the gap if there is a gap.
I: And what I also find interesting, we have already been talking about outcomes-based education. Do you feel OBE and teaching to OBE standards, has it changed the way
you teach language in the classroom. I mean obviously it has changed the way you teach in the classroom, but does it have an influence on how you handle language or how you use language to the pupils, how the pupils can use language in the classroom?
S: It was not really a change in the [...] of using the language. It was only in the constitution for OBE that each school must have two languages instead of three languages. That was the only change. Otherwise about language, they never say anything about how we use the language until I learned from my studies, about bilingual [...]. And I am fortunate because at school we realised that language is the problem. And in the ends we've got better results. So we all made it happen the language problem before the department decided on the outcomes- based. But I'm sure we're in the process of how we're going to tackle it until as from last year we had that research proposal that will [...] additive bilingual this year. So I might say I've learned about language not from the department, but from my studies, probably the most things I have done. ... And I'm not sure that other teacher or some teachers from other schools know exactly what I know because before we used to think that Xhosa learners who are studying in the white schools, we thought because they speak the language fluent and we think that they think with the [...] upon language. And we didn't see it as a problem with those learners but they are not free to use their cognitive until I learned to study. And if you are talking to other teachers whom, they never learned from any module, they started to isolate you because it was not the information we knew before. It is a new thing to us. So you need to convince them, you need to give them examples to see it. And you need them to educate your colleagues. Otherwise they will disagree with you. They understood the way they do.
I: If you say they will think that ...they wouldn't agree on this additive bilingualism approach, they would say no, no, no..., we can't
S: When we talk about additive bilingual, they think your mother tongue is not important because your mother tongue you are not going to use anyway when you are working. And they believe when you are proficient in the second language you are good as anyone. And everybody honoured you because you can speak the language so fluent. Not knowing that we're now talking about cognitive in order to apply for your academic and apprentice. They are debating only on the speaking or the fluency of the language, not on the cognitive or the academic approach.
I: How does your treat your school speakers of other languages? If am Afrikaans speaking or I'm English speaking, can I still come to your school if I I'm not Xhosa mother tongue speaker? Would I be allowed to come into your school?
S: Oh yes, you are allowed, but you will have to compromise because the option is only to learn two languages, Xhosa and English. So meaning that Afrikaans speakers are the minority. So we didn't even put on the proposal that we will consider Afrikaans. And also last year I had a girl, she was coming from [...], that is Johannesburg. And there it was not a Xhosa school, it was a Sotho school, that is one of the African languages. And so she was doing Sotho and English. But you will be surprised that by the end of the first term she was writing and creative writing in Xhosa.
I: If I send my child to your school ...do the students have to do a language test to show how good the Xhosa of my child would be? Do you have something like a language test to prove if I come into pre-primary and the child...
S: Oh yes, but it's not in the constitution of the school. It's something that I'm doing for my benefit. When I've got a new learner, I always assess that learner. Because before I teach him or her, I should know where the problems, if she is having problems from other schools debate, then the work that I've already done in the middle of the week. And if it is in the beginning of the year I always start with revision of the previous
grade. Then I've got results from that assessment. Then I will consider also that I've got learners who need help in those areas.
I: But that might also be for mother tongue speakers who comes from a different school or something?
S: It happened before. I've got twins, there were in the Afrikaans school and they can't write Xhosa. So now I'm starting grade 1 work, starting with single phonemes. And one, she 's moving. And the other one I'm sure he's not [...] than the girl. And I see the progress from the one who is [...] too. During holiday you'll give them books to read so that they read incidental through learning the phonemes. Otherwise they're tackling it.
I: And if you say ... we just talked about the twins, and they came from an Afrikaans school...
S: But their mother tongue is Xhosa.
I: And how do you then deal with pupils who are second language learners like this boy who is Afrikaans mother tongue speaking and he comes to your school and into your classroom. How do you deal with second language learners?
S: I'm sure we are fortunate because we've got grade R. That is a pr-school learning. There is a good improvement with the preparation for the first term. In the previous years you were doing school-readiness with your learners, meaning that we have to show the learners how to hold a pencil, or do colouring in, how to organise their work. But we're not doing that anymore because pre-school is already done that. So I'm sure I'm like this boy because he was coming from a pre-school. And in this pre-school it is a Xhosa teacher. And I'm sure she was not compromising for using Afrikaans. So when he came into my classroom he was just fluent in Xhosa. And I couldn't even notice that he's an Afrikaans speaker until I've realised that he's struggled with phonemes. And there it was just a minor problem. It was not a major ...like... he was not the only one, there were about six. And he managed to cover them, I mean the phonemes before the other five could. So it was about the process of understanding what we are doing more than the language as a problem.
I: But if they do struggle, do they have like second language courses, extra lessons they can attend after school, that they do language courses?
S: No, it's not a course but as you are doing your group teaching. You will teach the whole class and then you give the one who understands the activity or the work, then you will leave behind with the one that you notice struggle. So we go slowly, we think [...] you've done.
I: And repeat it. That is probably also with mother tongue speakers, they can also struggle... or some of them are slower...
S: They do. That one is not the only one with the problems.
I: In your classroom, how do you deal with linguistic mistakes? If they make errors or mistakes, how do you deal with when the say something incorrect or use the wrong grammar. Would you correct it?
S: If it is an oral work or activity, I just give a flow for the lesson. But if it's a written work, then I'll show where the error is and then I will call the child to discuss with me. Because it happened, especially in the ... it's not linguist, it's about spelling, maybe omission of letters and [...]. Because we're dealing with little things with the [...] It's not about major problems. So you don't correct things once they're demonstrating because really, it is just an embarrassment to them. When it is a major error, then you start to address it, but not in the whole class. Maybe you can even ask one learner if one can correct it.
I: And also, I read in your work that you also sometimes after the lesson, you would write in onto the blackboard, this wrong sentence and then discuss it.

S: Yes, discuss it.
I: And do you take into consideration whether it is a mother tongue speaker or second language learner who makes the mistake? Or is that not...
S: Before it was not... I didn't consider it. But now after I did the module I realised it is really important. Because you can't expect a second language speaker to be in the same level with a person who is in the mother tongue.
I: And when you now say, that you realised that a second language learner will be in a different level and it might be more difficult for him or her. Do you sometimes wish you could speak the mother tongue to them when you realise they struggle.
S: Oh yes.
I: In which situations would you think 'now I would really like to speak the mother tongue of the child'?
S: I don't have a specific situation because really Afrikaans is not in my background. In P.E. we don't have Afrikaans speakers until you go to work. And when I was at school I had no interact with Afrikaans speakers. So it was a language just you learned, but no communication skills. And I would have said English was better than Afrikaans. And I'm sure it's because of the system that Xhosa people have that negative attitude with Afrikaans because we are forced to learn the language. And one will say to me, Afrikaans, it's much easier than English, but I disagree with that because I hated the language.
I: Can you tell me about that. I didn't know... you had to learn Afrikaans at school. You must learn it.
S: At school you were to write in Afrikaans, express yourself in Afrikaans orally and then until, that was before 1997, then until scholars from Houteng (?) made that a boycott that ... 1976 a riot.
I: Was that close...
S: It was about the language.
I: Right, because the didn't want to learn the...
S: They wanted to learn everything in English. So that's when they changed schools from Afrikaans because [...]worked in Afrikaans. And now if you can go to any institution like college department, you are realise that old people are fluent in Afrikaans than English because their training they got in Afrikaans.
I: My question before was when there are situations when you wish when the child speaks Sotho ... or you do speak Sotho ...
S: Yes.
I: But if there are situations where you wish you would speak the mother tongue. And now when you sort of realise that there is a communication problem, that you are stuck at a some point and you realise the child really doesn't understand what I want. How do you overcome these communication problems in your classroom?
S: If I've got a bilingual learner meaning that I've got a leaner who can understand or speak the language whom I can't speak. I use that learner as an interpret. Or else I'll be always using gestures to show body movement, to show that child what I really want to say.
I: What I'm interested in looking at is a multilingual teacher. Especially in South Africa it is so interesting. And what would be in your opinion an ideal multilingual teacher, if you had to describe this teacher, what would be your picture of that teacher?
S: I'd take that teacher from Houteng (?) because that's were a multilingual of the eleven languages. You know here in Eastern Cape, the majority is only Xhosa people. They won't even know Zulu. Zulu, it's similar to Xhosa, it's speaker there and then. But in Houteng you will find that in one area, you'll find different people speaking all eleven languages, meaning that you have to communicate with each person with his or her
mother tongue. At the end of the day, you will find people understand six languages, speak fluently, are proficient in six languages out of learning. But here in the Eastern Cape we've only got three languages, unless you've got one African language, meaning your parents, maybe your mother, it's a clan from those areas ... tribes. Otherwise, in the Eastern Cape, we've only got three languages. But in Houteng you will get a multilingual teacher, and that teacher is very confident, is good in communication. And it helps that teacher to mix easily with other people because of that confidence of the using the language. Language helps a lot in terms of communication skills. Our children are speaking English fluent than us because the system is different. There are in the multiple choice school, my child is in a private school. So you'll realise that by the age of eight years, nine years, you can ask the child to go anywhere. He can express himself and be comfortable where he is, unlike us. We were like in jail, you wanted to express yourself, but you don't know how to express yourself. And it makes you to have those complex and anxiety, you have that fear of the unknown because of the system. So a multilingual teacher, it's somebody who is an asset in teaching. You learn different ways of teaching, you learn different approaches of doing things according to different cultures, according to differences.
I: And how do you think if you describe this ideal multilingual teacher, how do you think could a teacher best be prepared for that teaching in a multilingual context with different mother tongue speakers. What would you tell this teacher to do?
S: Oh, it would be a long term planning because you'll have to consider all learners who have different mother tongues in your classroom, meaning that in one lesson you will have to take words and you interpret those words into different languages, meaning you'll use more than one period, even in a week for one lesson.
I: And if the teacher is doing his teacher education, what would you recommend a teacher to do when he is doing his teacher training, what should he do...?
S: I would love to see multilingual teachers as from the form they [...] this (?) because that is where we think it is very important to give learners a good background and good skills so that they can use it. As in terminal stage in grade five because grade five thinks that it's to be abstract. And in the foundation phase skills are just concrete. So I would love to see a multilingual teacher in the lower grades.
I: Would you also recommend language courses?
S: Language courses and also language courses and content. As I've done this module of "Teaching Content and Language" so I see the importance of using simultaneous both content and language. So I wouldn't say only language.
I: And probably also looking at the background, not only the language. I find that interesting, the connection with culture and language. My last question on this paper, we have been speaking a lot about additive bilingualism and you were telling me about this pilot project you do at your school. How do you personally feel about additive bilingualism? Do you think it is a good way to go? Or you a bit ... how do you feel about it?
S: Oh yes, I agree with additive bilingualism because I understand it is hoping. We'll be practice with this additive for a couple of nine years, meaning that we will start with our grades R this year. And If I'm talking about nine years, those grade by the time they're doing grade 12 they will have $50 \%$ proficiency in both languages, meaning that in grade R they are only introduced in English for about $5 \% .5 \%$ will be maybe 13 or 16 minutes lesson per week by a white lady, I mean an English speaker. It's still going to be hard work for us because of that one lesson from [my teacher?] . She tried to introduce a rhyme lesson, and there were instruction in the lesson. But learners because they are second English speakers, they couldn't move, and she had to use gestures, and they were just staring at her. Maybe she was different because of the
colour, and also she's got long hair. And I don't know, I'll have a better comment towards the end of this year when we I really get a full picture of what I can in terms of doing it critical. Otherwise theoretical, I can agree with it.
I: And do you feel that doing that they' always learn their mother tongue in a good way?
S: Yes, because what we're doing from the previous year, we're doing some subtractive bilingualism. And we are not away of the damage until one highlighted that we're only using our mother tongue in assented (?) as from grade 4 . Then we realised with what we've done in the foundation phase, there is a gap with what we're doing in the intermediate phase. The only learn the language in the foundation phase. And then there are not happy if I can tell you the truth. You'll be teaching, and they will be very confused. Not a happy face you'll see because they don't understand what you're saying.
I: With the additive bilingualism approach, do you feel they will be fluent in English by the time they write their ... in which language would they write their matric?
S: As from last year, there was a proposal from the [...], minister of education that learners will have instructions in all eleven languages. So meaning they are going to express themselves in their mother tongue. I don't know when we're starting, I'm interested.
I: And that means that they can also write their final exam ...
S: ... in their mother tongue. And before I started to know about the bilingual and know, I said oh we're losing. We're losing the standards because if everything is going to be in their mother tongue one don't be proficient in other languages. But now I know the reason for doing it, it's about understanding instructions. And giving the gap now for the learners to express themselves ... maybe they will say they must write it in English but the instruction should be in Xhosa. It's possible. Because we still have to keep that standard of using a universal language. We still have communicating in it.
I: So that were all my questions on my paper. Thank you for answering all of them. [...] But most questions were straight forward...
S: Yes, they were, they were relevant. [...] And it's nice also to recall.

I = Interviewer
S=Sarah

## Appendix 6 Questionnaire

## A. Questions for the research project

1. To what extent could you bring in and use your own teaching experiences in/to the module "Teaching Content and Language"?
2. What was completely new to you? What struck you most as something you had not thought about before?
3. Do you think you can apply the theoretical concepts introduced to you in this module (e.g. BICS \& CALP; task-orientation, etc.) to your own classroom situation? Explain and give an example.
4. How useful did you find doing small action research in your classroom? Which insights did this give you?
5. Did you learn anything interesting about your own teaching and communication behaviour watching yourself on the video?
6. Do you think that any of the following key concepts have changed their meaning for you personally in the course of the module?

- bilingualism and especially additive bilingualism
- the relationship between language and culture
- aims of teaching in a bi-/multilingual classroom
- special teaching principles for teaching in a bi-/multilingual classroom

7. Which of these insights will you be able to apply (and might therefore influence your teaching in the future)?
8. Or are there any instances where you actually have applied them already over the last few weeks?
9. If you think that would not be possible, please explain why.
10. Do you feel you can combine what you have learned in this module with South Africa's concept of OBE?

## B. Questions for a revision of the module

11. Can you give any advice in which points the study-guide should be changed, extended, shortened? Please be as detailed as possible. If you could give page numbers, it would be very helpful.
12. Do you think the module was (or any details were) too theoretical?
13. Do you think the audio-/ video recording of your learners was worth the effort?
14. Did the fact that the lecturer was not South African have an influence on the module?

## Appendix 7 Summarizing Content Analysis Ruth


wait to get into the classroom - and that was the norm in those days. I think it was exactly 20 years later, having taught a lot of relief work and temporary work, jumping from grade one to grade 5 to grade 3 , I realised that the little ones had a draw for me and I enjoyed them very much - when I taught the little ones when their teacher was sick, I didn't want their teacher to get better - I was enjoying it so much in grade 2. I fell in love with my husband and fell in love with grade 2. I realised that if I was going to stay in the foundation phase, in junior primary, then I needed to get another qualification in that particular phase. So then I studied part time for 2 years. I did that training which helped me to get a permanent position. Then 3 years ago my friend Ros studied and she encouraged me to study further - because a lot of the girls, coming from school, were getting degrees and at that stage I only had a diploma - and I really felt it was necessary to upgrade the diploma to a degree . I studied both times part time and through distance education. So it wasn't the local university or college. I found that suited my needs, because I am quite disciplined and I could just study when I wanted to. I got that qualification this year.
I: And did you feel, looking back at your first college, and also the degrees that you had afterward, did you feel well prepared - you said you felt itchy, going into the class.
R: Yes, but you never, ever stop learning . I think particularly with the new generation and we call it the new millennium -
there is a new generation of children and a new generation of parents - and to understand those parents. A lot of those parents work, both work, or are single parents - and the children are definitely brought up completely differently from the way I was brought up - that's the way I brought my children up - their times are different, eating habits are different. Family times are different - and it's to try and understand ... I have a lot of children in my class this year who have good intelligence, but a lot of emotional problems. And dealing with that, you are learning all the time - because each

|  |  | needs to be open |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| enjoys teaching little children | prefers <br> teaching <br> little <br> chyildren | K3 teaching: <br> - for long time <br> - enjoys it <br> - love for people <br> - good |
| fell in love with grade 2 | prefers teaching little children | education <br> - prefers teaching little children <br> - further |
| studied part time for two years | doing further education | education necessary > better teacher <br> - always learning > new |
| felt it was necessary to get degree | necessary to do further eaucation | generation <br> - practice important <br> - should be close to real life |
|  |  | K4 in South Africa: <br> - school management important <br> - teaching at privileged school > makes |
| you never stop learning | always learning | teaching easier <br> - children have to speak |
| new generation of children and parents | new <br> generations | speak <br> English > <br> English <br> school <br> - at first not much empathy for L2 learners <br> - Apartheid culture ingrained > |
| children have good intelligences, but emotional problems | emotional problems of children despite intelligence | takes time to overcome children don't see colour > |


of child - and it makes teaching a lot easier. I mentioned problems earlier on, but they are minor compared with what some teachers have to deal with. So I feel very privileged to teach in such a well run, well resourced school - and it makes teaching a pleasure. It has it's moments, but teaching always does.
I: And how many pupils do you have in your class?
R: There are about 27, but since I've been there - that's for 8 years - those numbers have fluctuated. When I started there were 34 to 36. It's gone down - I think one year I had 22. I suppose the average is about 28 , which is very handleable. My classroom itself is a bit small for 34 , but considering that some of the teachers are teaching classes of 40 and 50, I can't complain.
I: And when you look at your class, do you what a lot of different
mother tongue speakers in your own
classroom or -
R: Yes, particularly in the last 8 years . Before that most of the children were English speaking. Some were Afrikaans speaking, but at the moment I've got English and Afrikaans and Xhosa and one of the girls has an Indian dialect that she speaks at home - so there are a number of languages.
I: And how do you feel personally about having different mother tongue speakers?
R: I think I was terribly influenced by one of the higher order teachers, in that we were told from the beginning, when this integrated system started, that this was an English school - and the children were to speak English and we were to encourage them to speak English.

And I had that same viewpoint at that stage. But my opinion has changed and I think maybe through studies and seeing who the children are, how difficult it must be to try and converse, never mind study and understand, in a second or third language Just, for example, sitting in groups and brainstorming. You know, one of the things we learnt, one of the modules was:
makes teaching a lot easier privileged to teach in a well run and resourced school
numbers of students
fluctuating
average size of 28 -handle able
making
teaching easier teaching in privileged school
changing number of students
handle able numbers
eight years ago since eight
most children years, a
were English number of
speaking - now languages
there are a
number of
languages
when integrated system started
was told that
this is an
English school

- children had
to speak
English
had the same studies
viewpoint, but changed my
opinion
changed
through studies
and realising
how difficult it must be for children to converse and
study in L2
brainstorm in Xhosa ? They have to do 2 children not steps. They have to think in their own brainstorm in mother tongue and then translate into L1?
English - and I've definitely changed my
opinion, and we can learn from them.

I would love to learn to speak Xhosa. I hear the
English first language children speaking and
learning Xhosa when they have their lessons
with a Xhosa speaking lady. And I'm
actually quite jealous, because they know I
lots more than I do - and they are at a stage e
where they will soak it all in. But I don't
think that in the past I've been as empathetic
towards the children who have English as a second or even third language.

I'm realising more and more that I need to understand where they are coming from.
I: You said you have a range of different languages - do you speak any of the other languages in the classroom?
R: Only Afrikaans.
I: And is it also a language - would you use it in the class if you have an Afrikaans girl?
R: Strangely enough I haven't done it to a large degree - maybe to a lesser degree.

But I think it's so ingrown in me that one must speak the language of the school, which is English. And it's actually quite sad.

I have used on occasions - and it's lovely to have children from another language - particularly like Afrikaans - it helps when we're teaching and the children are learning Afrikaans, to have the real, pure pronunciation from these little children
-and they feel very special, like in the Xhosa classes as well, for them to give their knowledge in that situation.

But when we're teaching in English, we don't always bring in a word from the vocabulary of another language. We talk about frogs - do I
have definitely
changed my mind have English as L2 in the past
need to understand where they come from
speak only
Afrikaans
ingrown in me to speak language of
school - quite
sad
lovely to have
children from
another
language when
teaching it, e.g.
for the
pronunciation
makes children
feel special
don't use other languages when
teaching
in learning
viewpoint
changed
want to learn other languages
at first not much empathy for
L2 learners

Afrikaans
L2
don't use no languages
Afrikaans (to beside
large degree) in English used
class in class
tinput of mother tongle speakets in L2 teaching
giving learners selfconfidence
must speak language of sehool
$\qquad$
even know what a frog is in Xhosa? I know English what it is in Afrikaans.

Maybe that's the way I could learn and reinforce certain vocabulary in the children.

But the changes must come and will come - but it's difficult when you're old at teaching.
I: You say you sometimes use a word with the pupils - if parents come to see you would you use it? Afrikaans words.
R: No, I wouldn't - I'd be very nervous.
I: What I was especially interested in ... after Apartheid, you don't have only English speaking schools, but it's more the norm that you might have mixed schools - different cultures and different languages in the classroom - and I mean ... has this also happened in your classroom, that you now have a different culture?
R: Yes, definitely. Two years ago we had a very interesting family - there were twins and they were Muslim and very religious. And because they wouldn't even eat some of the little cookies that other children brought because of their diet and the very strict Muslim religion. So we actually brought that into the classroom - and we had an opportunity - we invited the mother - she came and it was a wonderful opportunity for us to learn the culture of the Muslim people - and how they do their rituals and their beliefs.
We've also had Indian dancing at the school and Xhosa traditional dancing. Also there are certain games that the Xhosa children play. The children must be allowed to bring in those games. It's part of their culture - the games that their grandmothers and grandfathers played. They should feel free to bring in those specific areas of culture. So we do encourage it. When there is a Festival of Lights, we remind the children about that - and I think it's the Divali, when they bring their little sweetmeats and share them - and we talk about that. We've also done traditional bead making, where we invited a Xhosa lady to come and show the girls - and she actually dressed them up in different
beside
English
would help children to learn vocab
changes will come, but is difficult when you're old at teaching

$\qquad$





$\qquad$

wonderful opportunity to bring in the culture of the Muslim and invite a Muslim mother into the class
children should feel free to bring in their culture and we encourage it

changes
necessary

Dringing different cultures into the class
encourage
children to bring in their culture
clothing with beadwork. Certain beads mean different things. If you're getting married, you wear one - and if you were in mourning, you'd wear another. So we try and use as much as we can - bring in the parents of the children in our class - to come and share their culture with us.
try to bring in as much culture with the parents coming into the class to share their culture
important that parents see they parents are accepted, also for children

Apartheid
culture
ingrained in our
generation
took time to took time to hug and kiss a overcone black child Apartheid
sad thing as
children don't children
see colour don't see colour
always
ingrained they apartheid were different, ingrained but now we see them all the now all the same same

OBE allows working in learning groups through information sharing between learners with different competences in group work
have been able to lead a group, show their skills - and then it doesn't always happen that they are the leaders. We can have turns, where there is mixed ability - and then a Xhosa speaking group on their own, working together - and then one of them would become the leader.

So there's a lot of interaction. It has changed my whole concept - and I believe that either when I go to a workshop - and even the modules that we've just done (repica?) - the time just goes so much quicker - you are more exited when you have participated - and so it must be for the little ones as well - rather than just sit and chalk and talk. It's far more advantageous all round . It's just very difficult to always, as a teacher and facilitator (more than a chalk and talk person) to be aware of what's happening in each group. It's difficult to find yourself in the spot where you are needed - and maybe in a place where you need to interject or add in or encourage.

You try and be all over in the groups - but sometimes it's difficult and when you turn your back maybe there's conflict or maybe an error. So I think it must be very difficult for inexperienced teachers. As an experienced teacher, you have ears and eyes as far as you can put them. But it is not always easy to facilitate and assess group work as a whole in the classroom . You are maybe assessing one particular aspect of one group, or some groups, but to assess all children in all aspects is really impossible.
I: And when we look at the language policy ... do you look at people with different languages when they are second language learners, what does -?
R: Yes, in the junior primary I think I can speak partly for them, in that we have Xhosa assemblies and in the past we've had (which have been very interesting) all the grade ones and twos and threes meet in the hall and then they do little plays and poems - and act out little things that they've learnt, using the vocabulary that they've learnt from the other children in the grade . I don't know if that actually happens in the senior primary. But it has made me think that we don't actually do that in Afrikaans, for example,
leads a group
confidence
a Xhosa
speaking group working together
a lot of interaction changed my whole concept
time goes quicker when learners can participate rather than chalk and talk
easier for experienced teacher but not always easy to facilitate and assess group work
working in
groups
much interaction
viewpoint changed
learnercentred, participation
in the junior
primary we
have Xhosa assemblies and in the past they did plays and poems using vocab they had learned
not done for
Afrikaans though it also

Xhosa used in junior primary
which perhaps we should. We don't have an
Afrikaans assembly, which we should. A lot of the people believe that Afrikaans is a dying language - but it is another representation in our school and maybe we need to look at that.
I: And what I'm interested in is: if I have a little child, and I want to bring the child to your school, and it will start off in pre-primary, and if it doesn't speak the language yet (in my family I would speak Afrikaans - or I would speak Xhosa) and my child doesn't yet speak the language, how does the school react? Is there anything like a language test?
R: Yes, they are tested. Eight years ago it was very different. I had a child in my class who came into my class and couldn't speak a word of English . And strangely enough, before that, when I was at the boys' school, I had a little boy from Germany who couldn't speak a word of English. He came in May. He was a very bright child.

But it was such a challenge for me. I first taught him to say when he needed the toilet. It was one of the highlights of my teaching, because that little boy was so bright, by September he was writing in English, better stories than half the class. And I would give him 10 to 15 minutes of my time per day and we had a box. Every day I took a box with a letter. So he was learning vocab and spelling of the objects in the box every day. He was just a remarkable child. And then a little girl who 8 years ago came to my class - just excelled so beautifully. She actually got a bursary from England for the high school last year.

Maybe these are 2 unusual cases, but it just showed me how, through sheer determination and a certain amount of intelligence, they can and will strive in a school where their language is not the target language.

But there have been cases of children who have struggled. And often they are in an English
represents
school - a lot of people believe Afrikaans is a dying language
if child doesn't speak English as L1 there is a test
8 yrs ago, it was different some children in the class
didn't speak any English
such a challenge for me and one of the highlights of my teaching to teach a bright
German boy English gave him 1015 min of my time per day for him to learn vocab and spelling through objects in a box
showed me how determinathrough tion and determination intelligence and intelligence important to they can and learn will strive language
nowadays
test if learner not English L1
speaker
challenge to
teach L2
speakers
English where their language is not target language
environment, they are hearing English for maybe 5 to 6 hours a day at school, correctly spoken, and they go home and their own family speak another language - or speak English incorrectly. One day I had a Mom say to me:
"my child had very much fun today". Now that child is hearing her mother say "very much fun". That's just one error.
If she's hearing that incorrectly at home, maybe there's not the apparatus or material to stimulate that child.

A child can actually flounder. We have had cases where there isn't the stimulation at home, where the parents are not fluent in English. So what they are hearing at school is only part of their day - and it's not consolidated with anything at home.
Sometimes they are better off at schools where they can speak their own tongue.
I: And if you do realise that there's a child who might not have developed the linguistic skills or the language as well as mother tongue speakers, how would you -?
R : We do provide better quality in the junior phases. We have lessons where we have to take them for language - and they have smaller groups. They also go for remedial language. I take the grade threes for language - and it's not just children whose mother tongue is not English. It can be English mother tongue speakers whose language is not fully developed. We take them in smaller groups -
and we deal with themes and vocab and reading and comprehension and that sort of thing.
So we do try as much as possible to encourage
them to read. I think a child that is
encouraged to read, sees and absorbs the
written word and therefore can progress at a
faster rate.

But the children who suffer are usually the ones who don't have the reading skills and are not
there were also children who and struggled -in stimulation their environment
English was
spoken
incorrectly
stimulation and consolidation missing at home
a child can
flounder
sometimes they are better off at school where
they can speak their tongue
in junior phase, language
lessons in small groups
both L1 and L2
speakers whose
language is not
fully developed
deal with
themes, vocab,
reading,
comprehension
encourage reading
children to read encouraged
faster rate when
written word is
seen and
absorbed
children who reading
stimulated at home to read.

I: And then your own classroom - if you look at those who might be disadvantaged in their language abilities - how would you deal with linguistic (mistakes?) ?
R: If it's a one-to-one, I would possibly correct them - if they asked me a question and there was an error - but I wouldn't do it in front of the class.

I've also changed my mind totally with their creative work - and I've seen a huge improvement. I've just marked their creative work today. Because I was initially trained in senior grades, ...

Side two - indistinct at first
R: Children in the junior phases are allowed to have this free flow of writing. And when I first got taught at grade 2 level I tried to change everything and correct everything and make sure they had proper sentence construction - and I do believe, with hindsight, that I was doing the children a huge disfavour, because they just saw red pen all over their wonderful stories. So the next time they wrote a story, they would come and check with me what the correct spelling was and if the sentence was correct and it stilted their flow of writing. For 3 or 4 years - it has taken me that long to learn this. I have realised how important it is for them to have a free flow. It's fine, it doesn't matter about spelling, because when the thoughts are here, they must flow.

In time, they will learn that correct spelling and sentence construction. But the content - and being able to put the language of their thought on paper is so vital.

And I have seen in the last 3 years that I have changed my approach, the quality of writing is phenomenal. The stories that the children
suffer often the ones who don't have reading skills and are not stimulated to read at home
if it would be one to one I would correct them, but not in front of the whole class

I've changed my mind with creative work
at the beginning I corrected everything and did children a disfavour
it made them check with me correct spelling and sentence structure stilted their flow of writing realised how important flow is
they'll learn correct spelling and sentence construction in time - vital to put thoughts on paper
since I changed my approach
viewpoint changed in correcting
flow is important flow is important changed in correcting
correcting not in front of class

important
wrote for me today, at the age of 7 and 8 quality of years is phenomenal - because they have a writing is news time, when they write news as well. phenomenal There is no pressure - I'm just allowed to write my thoughts.

And it has been a huge turnaround, for me as a teacher, to see that.
I: And obviously that is for all the children their mother tongue speakers - ?
R: Yes
I: And if you have a Xhosa or mother tongue speaker, do you take that into consideration as well, when you correct them, or not correct them?

R: No, I don't take that into consideration. They actually do very well. Because, 8 years ago, children were allowed to come into what we called a Model C school at any grade, where they are still allowed at any grade, a lot of them had maybe 3 or 4 years of grounding in a township school - and then slotted in like the child who eventually got the bursary. In our opinion, she didn't have a good, solid foundation. So she had gaps in her education. So that's why it was sometimes very difficult for a child to slot in to a grade in the fourth or fifth year of schooling, when she'd had a poor foundation. But the children that we teach, or have taught, in the last 3 or 4 years, have come right from the bottom from the pre-primary level - so they are getting exactly the same education (mother tongue and non-mother-tongue speakers) the same foundation as the rest - and therefore they are keeping up . That's the difference compared with 8 years ago - when they slotted in and then floundered.
I: And all of a sudden they had to speak the language.
R: They had to speak the language - and had to do everything in English.
I: And you say you don't make a difference, whether it's a mother tongue speaker? Are there still sometimes situations where you think: "They would now know how to say this in Xhosa", that you would wish that you could speak their mother tongue - that you could just say it to them quickly?
no pressure -
allowed to write thoughts
huge
turnaround for me as teacher
$8 y r s$ ago when children were slotted in they often had a poor foundation and gaps in education
children over
last yrs come from pre-primary-get same education and have same foundation L1 and L2
speakers)
correcting
flow is important viewpoint changed correction behaviour the same for all learners
foundation important
learners now havedsame foundation

R: Definitely.
I: And are there some ways that you try to overcome ... I try to explain it in English and the child just looks at me and doesn't understand me, are there ways of overcoming that?
R: Yes. A few years ago, when we had this situation, we used to use other children to explain.
I: That probably makes it (possible for you to) move on again?
R: Yes.
I: Now, coming closer to the end, one question that I find quite interesting - because I'm looking at multilingualism in the classroom if you think of a multilingual teacher, what do you think would be an ideal multilingual teacher?
R: A teacher who is able to speak the language herself. And there are teachers (like that) and they must be a cut above the rest of us who are able to speak Afrikaans, English and Xhosa fluently - and maybe even another language. There must be those out there. I think the children who were brought up on the farms in the Eastern Cape area - they were very fortunate, because they learnt from the workers on the farm how to speak Xhosa - and we actually have a number in our school at the moment. At least $20 \%$ of our staff can speak all 3 of those languages and I think they are at a huge advantage because they can then maybe just have the odd word or phrase or encouragement to that child, in her own language, which would be very special to that child.

I went to one course at the Technikon to learn Xhosa, but unfortunately the teacher wanted to teach us grammatical things and comparisons to Sotho - and I was interested in conversational Xhosa - and still am.

I said odd things to the class, that I've picked up - and they laugh, they love it - especially the Xhosa children.
I: And when you speak about doing language courses, what would equip a teacher to be
definitely wish
to speak the mother tongue of the children
wish to
speakL1 of learners
other learners as interpreters
important to spezk language of learners
important $\mathrm{t} \sigma$ speak languages of Tearners

```
important to
speak
```

languages of
hearners
they are at an advantage have words, phrases, encouragement in own lang. of child - must be special to child
did Xhosa course, but not conversational enough - I'm still interested
in it
said a few importanto
words in class - speak children love it, languages of

| this ideal? What would a teacher have to do? | especially L1 speakers | learners |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| R: Even in the module we've just done, when we spoke about a bilingual lesson, to me it wasn't purely bilingual. To me, bilingual means 2 languages - not just catering for children with another mother tongue. | to me bilingual means using two languages | taught at dxal- |
| I did teach at a stage - it was very exhausting - a special class - a group of children who struggled academically. And they were 2 languages, English and Afrikaans. So whatever I said, I said in 2 languages. | I taught in two languages very exhausting makes child lazy who's | medium <br> dual medium doesn't |
| It possibly makes the child who is learning the target language lazy, because they will only want to hear their own. | learning target language as they only wait to hear their own language | support <br> language <br> learning |
| And in fact, I went to a school myself, when I was a child, where it was English and Afrikaans - and when the notices were in Afrikaans, I didn't listen to them. And so you can tune in to whatever language you are happy with and feel at ease with. So in a way, that would have advantages - and probably would have disadvantages, because the child who needs to learn, for example, English, and is having the teacher do her own Afrikaans in between is not going to learn the English. She's only going to focus on the Afrikaans. | went to dualmedium school as child - <br> English and Afrikaans didn't listen to notices in Afrikaans <br> child will focus on own language and not learn the other one | dual mediym doesn't support <br> lansuage <br> learning <br> dual mediym doesn't support language Kearning |
| But I think there are ways. And again, we need to change and adapt to them, to bring in maybe vocab and phrases - not to translate everything, but maybe on a Wednesday we can use Xhosa phrases and on a Tuesday use Afrikaans phrases. The teacher would get her tongue around the phrases - and she could pick them up from the children. They are able to help you. They would love to help you. So a true multilingual teacher needs, in my opinion, to be very open. She's also going to make mistakes and struggle At one stage I had to teach Afrikaans children in Afrikaans. I had to teach them geography. They helped me - and I wasn't embarrassed - I said "Thank you". Perhaps in | there are ways, changes need to be made - use vocab and phrases in different languages on different days <br> children can help teacher - a true multilingual teacher needs to be open - she will make | changes negessary <br> teacher needs to be open |

the higher grades they are going to be mistakes and unkind. But they will encourage the teacher, struggle I am sure. So if we changed our focus to be teaching at, I know it sounds harsh - but I would, as a Xhosa mother, do that. Because ultimately there is a better future for that child if she is totally fluent (competent) in English.
P: First of all, you mentioned your dual medium teaching experience - and it sounded like you were a learner - a pupil - in a dual medium ...
R: I was - and I taught. And I had to teach subjects in Afrikaans. I taught Afrikaans to Afrikaans children.
P: And you didn't repeat the sentences in English?
R: No. But in a special class situation I had to. In a special class of say, 20 children, 8 were English and 12 were Afrikaans speaking. So you had to cater for both. That was one post. I did relief work.
multilingual, there are ways and means of doing it. And we would learn and grow ourselves through it.
I: And when we look at different ways of doing it ... additive bilingualism and how do you feel?
R: Because English is the language of power to a point - you know if you go through on the Internet, you are going to go through in English - there is just so much that is English. Even our parliament is speaking English. Our country is focusing towards English, being one of the International languages.

If I was a Xhosa speaking parent, even though I knew that my child's own mother tongue and culture might suffer, for the benefit of him or her in the future, I would want her to have English as a first language in instruction. Because ultimately it's going to be a better life for her or him.

I can maybe as the mother of a Xhosa speaking child try and instill the culture and whatever at home - but if I know that the instruction is in English and the child is being taught correctly in English in a school like I'm
there would be ways if we would change our focus to be multilingual English is language of power international language , home
If I would be English Xhosa parent I would want my child to learn English for a better future, even when I know L1 and culture might suffer instill culture at cunture at culture at
home

P: I'm very pleased that Randi's heard you talk about dual medium in South Africa. It would be interesting to compare that with what Heike is trying to do in terms of bilingual education. You and she might have further thoughts on that because you have sometimes taught in dual medium - taught in the other language. The second was that you've just mentioned in passing that the qualifications that you've taken - you've said that school management skills were very helpful, insightful for you - and then also the language courses. Can you just comment a little bit about the language courses?
R: I think you are either a mathematical person or you're a language person. I'm certainly not a mathematical person. And strangely enough, as a child, I didn't do a lot of reading. In fact, I still don't do an awful amount of reading - but I love playing with words and language - and I'm fascinated by maybe the development of language . The one module was called something in language and teaching. I found that fascinating and it also gave me insight, for example, on process writing, which we don't deal with in schools. Where they write - and you can correct the odd one - and then they rewrite. We don't have time for that. Every week we are giving them a new theme and something else to write. And they don't actually see that as a (perfected?) thing ultimately that we would do. For example, when I type on the computer now, there will be a number of times before I actually hand in whatever I'm doing - because I'm checking and I'm changing. But we don't give the children that opportunity to check and change. Maybe even the one that they wrote today - if they looked at it themselves, they could find their own errors, if they sat with a buddy - maybe the friend could say "you've spelled that incorrectly", whatever. There just doesn't seem to be enough time to do what is natural in the real world - and that is where you check and change and ask someone's opinion and ultimately before you complete your task, you've looked at it a number of times and changed it. Even when you come back the next day sometimes,
$\begin{array}{ll}\text { love playing } & \text { interest in } \\ \text { with words and } & \text { language }\end{array}$
language -
fascinated by
the
development of
language相 we don't give
viewprint the children the changed opportunity to check and change when writing
when you've written something, you (think) maybe I should have done it this way. We don't give the children that opportunity. We seem to get on to the next thing and the next thing - and we need to do that process right. When you learn it and you sit up and think "It's true - why don't we do this in teaching? It's what happens in the real world."
P: And then it's interesting the transition from what you said was a higher order thing about only teaching English and only using English, to your noting that some learners actually need to go through 2 steps ... which came first?
R: We were told, when I came to the school, this is an English school - and we will speak English and the children may not speak anything else to each other even in the playground, in the passages - they will speak English. And at that stage, 8 years ago, I said "Yes - they will speak English." Why on earth can't they speak their own language to their friends in the playground? Why on earth can't they say to their friend in the group: "I've got an idea - let's do it this way." Does it seem rude, because there is someone else in the group who doesn't understand them and may feel that they are talking about them? What about that poor child for whom it is a second language - and they have to think in their mother tongue and then translate? It's just going to make them introverted and inhibited.

They should be allowed to - if you are going to brainstorm, thoughts must just flow. How can thoughts flow if you are restricting them?

P: So your reaction was, when you heard that instruction, almost immediately you responded in that way, feeling "this isn't right."?
R: No - in the beginning I thought "yes, yes." I accepted it - and then I thought "not on, not on."
P: What made you have this kind of insight and rebellion against that?
R: Because English was the way to go - and there must be purity - and they must hear it and if, for example, 2 people in the group are
you wonder teaching why we don't should be do that in close to teaching as it reality
real world
when I came to the school we were told this is an English school and children may not speak anything else but English - 8 yrs ago I believed in it
why can't they
use their mother L1 important
tongue - think in learning
in L1 and have
to translate it - harming
will make them children
introverted and
inhibited
should be allowed when brainstorming to use L1 -
thoughts must
flow
in the beginning I accepted it, later on I
thought 'not on' changed yiewpoint

English was the way to go there must be
flow is important
must speak
language of
not speaking the same language as the rest of us, we will feel that they maybe are trying to hide something, or talk about us. So it was a personal thing against the English in our particular school.
They said "for educational reasons, you must let them speak English and they must practise it" - which had its merits. But ultimately, you are actually restricting the poor child who just wants to have a conversation with their friend and can't.
P: And then I found it very fascinating about the cultures and the assemblies and so on - and your successes with that German boy and the girl who got a bursary. Another significant shift seems to have happened with you when you used to "splatter things with blood", the way I used to, when you marked - and now you are really excited about the passion that they have when they are free to write their thoughts. The slotting in. That caused problems when you let children come in at grade 5 or 4 . What is the school's policy now, about that?
R: They are still allowed to come in, but they are tested to a point. We must see their level. We are probably doing the child a disfavour by allowing them to come into the school if they are not at the level that the rest of the children are at. It's not good for them at all. So they are tested to a point in their written work and their maths - not just language
And this happens across the board. It's not just, for example, Xhosa speaking - if we get a child from China or from England or wherever, we just give them the basic little test first to see how they slot in.
If they are way behind, it's just going to be too difficult for them to slot in - so we suggest maybe a low level - and maybe they need to go to a school where the standards are not as high.
P: And also that you picked up that the dual medium is not ideal, because of the laziness - and that rather you are working out ways to cater for the multilingualism - a day a week for the different languages Muslim mother and her role is respected.
R: That is exactly what happened. She was looked up to. The children loved seeing her, because she came in to help out with books, etc and they would say hello to her - and she felt
purity - people school
feel they are trying to hide something or
talk about us when using L1
children need to practice
English, but you are
restricting child who just wants to have conversation with friend and can't
students
allowed to
come in grade 5 or 4, but they are tested to see their level doing child disfavour if it is behind the rest not just tests in language
not just Xhosa
children - basic test to see how
they slot in
if they are way
behind it will
be too difficult for them so we suggest lower level and maybe a school where standards are not as high
harming children nowadays
test if
learner not English L1 speaker test
test for all
language
speakers, not
only
language

Kearners send
to bther
schooks if too weak
very special.

I = Interviewer
$\mathrm{R}=$ Ruth
$\mathrm{P}=$ Professor

## Appendix 8 Summarizing Content Analysis Jane

| Original text | Paraphrase | Generalisati on | Reduction |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  | K1 language: |
| I: |  |  | intera |
| J: Since 1973-29 years | teacher for 29 |  | portant |
| I : And where and when? | s |  |  |
| J: I've taught all over the place. Started off in |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | ed in |
| schools. I've taught at private schools, boys |  |  | every life > |
| only schools, girls only schools, mixed |  |  | lping |
| schools. We moved to Pietermaritzburg and |  |  | ca |
| I taught at some very wealthy schools and also at some very poor schools. |  |  | Afrikaans |
| I: When you look at that, the different teaching experiences, was there something that was really satisfying for yourself? | going to miss | enjoying | - want to <br> learn <br> languages, |
| J: Very. I'm going to miss teaching tremendously, because I find the children very, very rewarding. | teaching - find children very rewarding | teaching | but not <br> strong enough <br> - important |
| I: You said that you have taught at quite different schools, quite different pupils, different backgrounds - is there something that you look back on and think: that was really -? |  |  | to speak languages of learners <br> - L1 important in learning |
| J : I think where I am at the moment - at [...] - is probably not perhaps the nicest experience , because you can get lots of perks at schools like Grey and Selbourne. Being a woman in a boys' school is very comfortable. I'm probably working harder than I have had to before. But I find what is so nice is having an input of young staff , that there is an energy about the school that is amazing. Whereas you get these state schools and you've got a pecking order - and we don't have a pecking order at all at Westering anybody can come in as a first year and their ideas are just as important as somebody who | where I'm at the moment, not the nicest experience working harder than before nice having input of young staff | school now notnicest experience <br> working harder now young staff | K2 awareness: <br> - background knowledge important aware of how to use language in teaching maths <br> - need important <br> - cultural background |


| has been there for 20 years. I find that very refreshing. |  | important sharing |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| I: That was now the teaching experience. Now |  | important need |
| I'd like to ask you a few questions about the education and preparation for teaching you |  | changes |
| did. First question: where did you do you |  | K3 teaching: |
| teacher training? |  | for many |
| I went to Natal University | couple of years wanted | years |
| there - and also the U.E.D. there. Then a | ago I decided I further | - working |
| couple of years ago I decided that I needed | needed qualifica- | harder no |
| something more - that I was getting.. | something more tions | - maths |
| teaching English and maths . And then of | teaching | wanted |
| course, just because there was a shortage of | English and teaching | education > |
| maths teachers and an overabundance of | Maths - haven't maths | losing |
| English teachers 20 years ago, I moved into | taught English |  |
| maths solely. I haven't taught English since then. | for 20 years | enthusias research |
|  |  | mportant > |
|  |  | ough |
|  |  | cory |
|  |  | more |
| stale. We were in | ns | actice |
| time and I did an F.D.E. in computer studies. |  |  |
| So I had another subject to teach, which was | did computer wanted/ | qualifica- <br> tions |
| wonderful because I then went into computer | studies - very | eady in |
| dies - and did computer studies and maths | refreshing to qualifica- | cher |
| for a good couple of years - and that was | teach another xions | training |
|  |  | K4 in South Africa |
| And I think that's why I've started with my | started with | during |
| nours now. Because I just need somethin | nours as I |  |
| more. I'm getting a bit bored with teaching. | need something qualifica- | languages |
| ather, It think that I'm losing my energ, | - - getting fions | ot learned |
| enthusiasm. | bored with | ambivalent |
| I: And when you look back at the different | ching, losing losing |  |
| acher training courses you've done - do | ergy and <br> energy and | bilingualis |
| you feel well prepared? When you first did | husiasm enthusiasm | > theory |
| your teacher education at Natal University, |  | ffect, but |
| did you feel well prepared? | nobody told us hot w | ght for |
| J: Don't be silly. Nobody taught us how to | how to teach |  |
| teach in universities in those days. We were |  | English <br> language of |
| merely thrown into the classroom with lots |  | wer > |
| of pedagogics and sociology and psychology |  | ore |
| and - experience was the best teacher. It's |  | support |
| certainly not like it is today. They hold their | today today | English school |
| ad a lot more in the education department |  |  |
| these days. And I like this learnership - I |  |  |
| think that's a fantastic system. But we were |  | K5 teachers in |
| certainly not prepared for high school |  | multilingual |
| teaching. |  | lasses: |
| I: And when you say you've done quite a lot of |  | numb |
| further teacher qualifications - is there |  | different |


| something that, when you look back, you find extremely helpful for your teaching situation now? | like the | research | languages often not pure English > |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| J: I like the research we've had to do. I find that | research we did | important | mixing |
| very, very interesting. One gets to the stage |  |  | languages |
| where you can have enough theory. You've | enough theory | enough | teacher |
| taught for so long and you think: I don't need |  | theory | always |
| somebody to tell me the theory of teaching - | the practical I |  | speaks |
| it's the practical I want. I want good ideas | want - good | practice | 2 learners |
| and different ideas. It's all very well saying: | and different | important | not catered |
| you must make teaching relevant. So teach | ideas |  | for |
| me how to. I want | teach me how |  | no L2 |
| practical things - and I think that's why the | to |  | math |
|  |  |  | always |
| research has been fantastic, because you are | research | research | simplified |
| actually interacting with children and you're | fantastic as you | important | language, |
| gleaning things from them, as opposed to some | are interacting |  |  |
| guru telling you what to do. | with children | interaction | standard > |
| I: When you say "research"? | and gleaning | with | no changes |
| J: We had to do quite a lot of hands on in the | things from | children | made |
| honours course - the science and the maths | them |  | t learning |
| and also with the multilingual - each week |  |  | language in |
| we had a little project. We had to conduct |  |  | group work |
| little surveys and practical things, which I find was very useful. |  |  | learners helping |
| I: Was there also something that you didn't find very helpful - or that you thought was rather a waste of time? |  |  | each other not correcting |
| J : What was a waste of time was learning Turbo |  |  | paraphra- |
| Pascal - and how to program in Turbo |  |  | sing |
| Pascal. It has now been chucked out of the syllabus - and they are now using Delphi. |  |  | students allowed to |
| That was a bit of a waste of 2 years. But you | use the |  | use L1 |
| can always use the principles. It's a bit like | principles |  | medium |
| learning vector algebra and you never use it |  |  | doesn't |
| in the schools. No, I don't think there was |  |  | support |
| anything that was useless - some a little |  |  | language |
| more useful than others. |  |  | learning |
| I: And when we look at your teaching situation right now, where are you teaching at the moment? |  |  | total <br> submersion not effective |
| J: I'm at [...]. |  |  | foreign |
| I: I know you don't have one classroom - you've got several classes, haven't you? |  |  | language courses |
| J: ....... |  |  | arning |
| I: In your classes, how many pupils are there in general? |  |  | $\begin{aligned} & \text { fun way }> \\ & \text { not } \end{aligned}$ |
| J: Very varied. My matric class is 19 and my grade 9 class is 33 . | varied numbers of pupils | varied <br> numbers in | dependant on passing |
| I: So there is quite a big difference, depending on the grades? |  |  |  |

J: Yes.
I: And if you look at these classes, which mother tongues do you -?
J: Mainly English. Some Xhosa, but not a majority in the classes. You probably find that you have 6 or 7 that are not English speakers. Although, a lot of them - we must clarify mother tongue English, but it's not pure English. A lot of the coloured folk speak almost a dialect , would you say? Their English is very, very different in their homes - from the English that we teach at school. So they find as much difficulty, I think, learning the theory of maths, because it's a foreign language to them. They've got nothing to hook their knowledge on -
there are no terms that they use that are ... they have a mishmash of English and Afrikaans and that is their mother tongue.
I: How do you feel personally about having all these different mother tongue speakers in one class?
J: Well, we don't cater for them. I think that's the saddest thing of all. I can't cater for them, because I speak English all the time. I can explain and paraphrase, but I can't speak Xhosa.

Basically the philosophy of the school is "we're an English medium school - if you want to come here, please make sure you're proficient in English." But of course, that doesn't mean to say that ... they've got just conversational English - and we've got to fill in from there.
I: And when you say you don't speak Xhosa, do you speak any of the other mother tongues like Afrikaans?
J: I understand it and I can speak it, but we don't speak it in class.
I: So you wouldn't use it with the learners if you have the sort of idea that this person, this pupil, doesn't understand, you wouldn't try to class
mainly English speakers in class, 6 or 7 non- English speakers
must clarify L1 English, not pure English Coloreds often speak a dialect difficulty as theory of maths is a foreign language to them - nothing to hook their knowledge on
mishmash of
English and
Afrikaans as L1
the sad thing is
that I can't cater for them as I speak English all the time - I can explain and paraphrase, but can't speak
Xhosa
philosophy of school-
English
medium school - if you want to
come here make sure
you're proficient in English

I can speak and understand
Afrikaans but don't speak it in
also non-
English speaker in class
often not pure English
background knowledge important
mixing
languages

L2 speakers not catered for
teacher
always
speaks English in class
have to speak English at school

Afrikaans L2
$\qquad$


medium school and you must have some
modicum of conversational English. They don't provide intervention courses - and that's why poor old Ronald got dumped - and he just sank or swam - and he's swimming very nicely, thank you. We do have some other Taiwanese children who are really battling. They don't have English skills. And the school is saying, basically, this is an English medium school. If you can't cope, you'll have to find an outside tutor to help you. It's quite rigid in that sense.
I: So there's no written rule to say we need to look after these children when they come with deficient language skills - we have to help - and there's no - they have extra classes or extra English or second language classes?
J: No - nothing like that.
I: So if you then still have children like this Taiwanese boy, he comes into your class obviously he was accepted, but his English is not as good as that of a mother tongue speaker. How would you then deal with it in the class?
J: He has one of those wonderful little computers, in which you put the English word and out comes the Taiwanese word. So he does his own little dictionary work. But - put him in groups - we've found out who he sort of related to and could communicate with - and they work very much in a group . So that he was comfortable - and he is able to ask his peers not necessarily in so many words, but point to and - you know. They've got their own way of communicating with him - and he has the most wonderful sense of humour. He jokes all the time. And he will come up to me often with his broken English and competitive. Don't dare do him out of a mark - he'll come and challenge. So communication-wise we're doing OK. Whether he's learning much English in my class, I don't know - but he's learning a lot of mathematical terms. And it's not necessarily going to help him conversationally, but it'll certainly help him mathematically
because he's got that background - a very good mathematical brain. So he seems quite he's got that

| English - no <br> intervention <br> courses | no second <br> language <br> classes |
| :--- | :--- |
| just sink or | sink or swim |

if you can't
cope you have to find outside tutor for help
nothing like written rule or extra language classes
he's got a translation computer
put them into groups they work very much in a group - able to ask peers

I don't know in subject whether he's like maths learning much English in my class - not helping him conversationally, but mathematically
no second
language classes
sink or swim
no second langyages chasses
setf help

## doing group

work
doing grotrp
work
learners hetp
each other not much language is learned

| happy. | background | knowledge |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| I: Also in mathematics, it's a lot of symbols. I remember reading that you don't need so many words - you do in a way, but you can also do a lot of - |  | important |
| J: Absolutely. He understands exactly what I'm trying to get at. So it does make it easier. |  |  |
| I: And when you say you teach a content subject and they might also be mother tongue speakers, but maybe second language learners - and when they communicate with you, or between each other, are there moments when you also focus on their language, when you correct mistakes? | I don't correct mistakes- find it | not correcting |
| J: I don't. I find that it's a bit harsh to correct their mistakes. If they are using something grammatically incorrectly, then I try and use the correct ... but I don't ever say to them: "That was wrong - now you should say it this way." | a bit harsh, if they use something grammatically incorrectly, I use the correct | grammar <br> paraphrasing |
| Unless, of course, it is a totally unacceptable word or expletive, which often comes out. | unless it's an unacceptable word or expletive | arly if it's unacceptable |
| You sometimes choose to ignore it and sometimes you don't. But I certainly don't correct their grammar . Now, for example, when Ronald comes and talks to me - the mere fact that he's coming to talk, it's not for me to correct him. My job is to understand what he's saying - and I will say to him "Do you mean this - or do you mean that?" And he will then be able to say yes or no. So I will paraphrase what he is saying, but I am not correcting what he is saying . He must just pick up the inference from there. | sometimes you ignore it. Sometimes you don't, don't correct their grammar <br> paraphrasing, but not correcting | not coryecting grammar |
| I: When we spoke about a teacher being able to speak the mother tongue - do you sometimes feel that you wish: "If I could now ..."? | love to speak | want to learn |
| J: Absolutely. I'd love to - but I am utterly useless with languages. I can't get my mouth | mother tongue of children, but | languages |
| around the clicks. They laugh at me all the time. And, of course I'm using the wrong click in the wrong place. It's a great pity and it's perhaps historical that we never learnt the African languages. | am useless with languages <br> great pity and historical that | Trseless with languages <br> during Apartheid, |
| I: So are there certain situations in which you think it would be extremely useful to know the mother tongue? | we never learnt African languages | African languages not learned |
| J: Absolutely - but unfortunately it's not |  |  |

important enough for me to move my butt and do something about it. I should, but I'm not.
I: And if you realise that there's some kind of communication problem - that they look at you with big eyes and they are not really sure?
$\mathrm{J}: ~ \mathrm{Oh}, \ldots$ Oh, absolutely. They can talk in whatever language they want to - as long as they are dealing with the subject at hand.
And sometimes I wish I knew what they were talking about, but you can certainly tell whether they are on the topic or not. Their body language and their tone of voice can tell you whether they are chatting or not.
I: So looking back for a moment at what you said about the language policy at the school, it's something quite OK if they are in the lesson and that your group will have to use their mother tongue?
$\mathrm{J}:$ Oh, yes. As long as they stick to the topic. But they can be talking English and still be off the topic - so that's got nothing to do with the languages. And often you find that they explain to each other in Xhosa.
I: Are you a bit sensitive to "are they really speaking about that" or if they are laughing about something - you realise they might have changed -?
J: Absolutely. Just their facial expressions. That doesn't have to be the language. You can look across the classroom and you can tell whether they are concentrating or whatever.
I: And when you now look at teaching in multilingual classrooms and having different mother tongue speakers and mixed classrooms, mixed schools - if you would have to give some kind of definition, what is an ideal multilingual teacher?
J : One who can understand the languages in the class of your students.
I: And would it only be to be able to speak the languages or -?
J: No, you would need to understand what's behind them. I find it fascinating that so many people go to ...
young teachers go to Taiwan or Japan or wherever to teach English.
not important enough to move my butt, I
should, but I'm not
they can talk in
every language - as long as dealing with topic, sometimes wish I knew what they talk about, but can tell
whether they're on topic - by their body language and tone of voice
often explain to each other in
Xhosa
an ideal
multilingual teacher is someone who can understand the languages of students in the class
need to understand what's behind them
young teachers
going overseas
to teach
want to learn
languages
not strong
enough
students
allowed in
class to use
L1
have tostay
on topic
want to leam
languages
body language important

students allowed in
important to speak languages of learners
need to
understand
cultural background
overseas experience

To try and find something of relevance that would interest them, you just have to know their background and their culture and what makes them tick. And the taboo subjects.
I: What would equip a teacher to be this ideal multilingual teacher? You say that students go overseas - do you think there would be other things that would be helpful to become?
J: Obviously, the courses . Like we've done now.

I think perhaps those sort of courses should go straight into the teacher training. I think there should be something at the first level teacher training - particularly in South Africa. Because one has to be aware of all the things that we've been learning about. And it's pointless only touching the honours and masters students. It's too late then, because generally those people are moving out of the nitty grit of teaching.
I: And when you look at the course - how hard it was to get enough people, because you think "Why don't we have more people on the course?" - but then it's sort of thinking it's only for masters students - if there are not enough masters students.
J: Absolutely.
I: And this is, I think, also a topic that should really interest everybody - the same as in Germany, they now teach students how to teach German as a second language because it's just an issue that is coming up and that teachers need to be aware of.
J: Absolutely.
I: Now let's speak about that one course - were you looking back at it and when you think: "We really need courses like that" - did you find what you expected in that course?
J: Yes, I did. I found there was quite a lot of repetition. Bev uses Cummins's work a lot and I found that I had already been open to all those ideas. It was very good. I just feel we should target all first year teachers . I target all first think that's where you need the course - not, year teachers perhaps, at a high level - but there's nothing that they can't handle. They need to be aware of this sort of thing - and of the
find something
of relevance that would interest them, have to know background, culture and taboo subjects
courses would
equip multilingual teacher
should go
straight into certain teacher training, qualificaon first level particularly in South Africa too late when teachers already have everyday routine
qualifieations already in leacher training
need to
understand
culyural
background
further
qualification
important
tions already
in teacher
training
certain

$$
y^{\text {namme }}
$$

was already Cummins'
open to ideas of
Cummins
need to be need to be
aware of this
strategies that one uses . And I think that's
very, very useful - this is how you do (it) in this situation - and just open it to more people, because I think it's essential. And particularly to the teachers that are in inservice training - that would be absolutely fantastic.
I: Because then they would have the practical side to it as well - because they would be in the classroom. I don't know whether they do that here - that they go to the school, teach -?
J: Yes.
I: At the same time do the education at the university - but they could really combine it in a way - and it wouldn't only be theory, but be something useful for them?
J: Very much so. Because I was disappointed that it was so small. I thought it would be a much, much bigger course. I expected 30 to 40 people to be interested.

J: ... the topic we did was logarithms - and I would have taken the whole concept - not just one lesson. And how would I have got this through to a multilingual class - and used written work and scaffolding - thought of ways of doing it.
I: Also because of limited time, obviously ...
J: Yes.
I: Because I also had the feeling now people are sitting at home, planning their lesson plan and then they come back, but we don't have any chance of really talking about it presenting it to each other - and saying what's good about it, what can be improved what I might like to do in my own lesson plan ... there seems to have been one session missing at the end.
J: Yes.
I: Things could have come together ...
J : Yes, to be discussed. I found it very useful doing that lesson plan, too, together. That was very nice because we picked up ideas from each other - things I wouldn't have thought of. Of course, that synergy is very good. But I would have liked to have developed that a little more - and then ended up with something - as you wanted to do. Implement it. And perhaps, in stead of when you come to the schools, just taping the lesson for transcription, we should tape the
and strategies one uses
particularly to teaches in-
service training
Cummins'
theories,
knowing
strategies
alreadyin
teaeher
training
would like to plan whole lesson plan and think about how implemento present concept to multilingual class
useful to do useful to lesson plan work together - more together ideas
would have
liked to
implement it

|  | ambivalent about additive bilingualism | ambivalent <br> about <br> additive <br> bilingualism |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |
| J: I'm very ambivalent abo |  |  |
| Whereas had I, perhaps, from grade 8 to whatever, gone into a parallel medium school ... although I was in a dual medium school and I taught in a dual medium school for years. | had I gone to parallelmedium school - though I went to and taught in dual-medium school | went to and taught in dual medium school |
| Even then, there wasn't very much contact between the children. There were the Afrikaans speaking children, there were the black children and there were the English speaking children and it was amazing that they did not socialise very much. The kids aren't political, but I think it's just a case of where they are most comfortable. Keeping together. <br> submersion doesn't work either, because you have to be credibly intelligent to cope. And we don't want to deal only with intelligent people we've got to deal with everybody. It will work for some people - it depends how that second language is presented. You have to want to learn it. I know I have a need to learn Xhosa, but my want isn't big enough to make me actually do it. | not much contact between different language groups | dual medium doesn't support language learning |
|  | total submersion | total |
|  | doesn't work must be very intelligent | submersion not effective <br> need want to |
|  | you | learn |
|  | want to learn it have a need to | language |
|  | learn Xhosa, but want not big enough to do it | want to leatn languages not strong enough |
| Perhaps that's |  |  |
| kids - a need. | engender a need in kids |  |
| Unfortunately, with English being powerful, we have this feeling that we don't need to learn other people's languages - because they'll talk our language anyway. I know that's an awful attitude to have, but that's how it is in South Africa, at least. | with English being powerful, feeling we don't need to | English <br> language of power |
|  | learn other |  |
| P: So - the honours course - that idea was also being promoted, wasn't it - the idea that the first language must be maintained? <br> J: Absolutely. <br> P: So theoretically you've been told that in 2 | languages awful attitude, but the way it is | want to learn langyages not strong |
|  | in South Africa | enough |
|  |  |  |

courses - but you still feel ambivalent about it?

J: The theory is perfect, but I just don't know if it's right in South Africa. I know that our black students must learn in their mother tongue. And this business of changing them over in grade 2 , or whatever it is, is ridiculous. I just know that we've got to have more support in English teaching that we aren't giving these children. It's no good giving them half an hour, once a day, and expecting them - by the time they write matric - to be able to speak that language.

That's basically what we had. Now we call that "additive bilingualism", but it wasn't - because we actually never had a situation where we spoke colloquially to Afrikaans people. We had a teacher who taught us the vocab - and in strange situations ... and we talked about going shopping and my holiday - this stilted sort of environment.

And I'm just very worried that we're getting the same situation here - that what we call "additive bilingualism" acually isn't at all. You're getting a history lesson or geography lesson ... it's just another lesson

- it's not really helping you to communicate
think our language teaching - particularly second language teaching, if it's Afrikaans in an English school or third language teaching, which is mainly vocabulary and basic sentence structure. We need more teaching like the courses they have - how to teach Taiwanese children - what do they call those courses?
theory is
perfect, but
don't know
whether it's
right for RSA know that black students need to learn their L1, ridiculous to change them over in grade 2, we've got to have more support in
English which
we don't give
children - no
good giving
them half an
hour once a
day, and expecting them
to speak
language when
writing matric
that's what we
had and call
now additive
bilingualism
but it wasn't as
we never used
language
colloquially
worried that we get that herecalling something additive bilingualism which is not
theory
perfect, but right for RSA?

L1 important
in learning
more support in English

L2 speakers not catered for

What we had we now call additive bilinguqlism but it's not
language needs to be used in everyday life what we hat we now all additixe
bilingualism but it's not
language
needs to help to comtrunicate
we need more
courses like
English as a
not helping you to communicate
need English
as a foreign

P: English as a foreign language.
J: Yes - those sort of courses.
P: They're very communicative and purposeoriented/ functional ...
J: That's what we need.
P: ... authentic - the kind of terms that came up in this module as well, like "authentic", "information gap" - all those sorts of things are practised in those kind of "English as a foreign language" courses - they're exciting and fun. There are motivated adult learners, and there's also a lot of activity and doing and role playing and so on. But you're quite right - second language and third language teaching is done rather badly by mother tongue speakers of those languages ... you know - and the emphasis is often on learners' making mistakes in grammar.
J : Absolutely. Learning those lists - just so that you could slot in the correct preposition.
P: We really need to impact the way second and third languages are taught - and, as you say, such modules should start lower down than the honours.
J: Yes.
P: And just one last observation I want to make - we've just been with Heather - both of you were at dual medium schools as pupils and you both taught for a number of years in dual medium schools... and she was also rather negative about it - and felt that the learners would become lazy and just wait for their Afrikaans or English to come up ... And yet that might have seemed to be an ideal kind of bilingual education, but -
J: No, it didn't. We need a different type of intervention altogether. And in our schools we need Xhosa to be taught right the way through - almost as we have with the new OBE - we have to teach arts and culture for 10 hours and life orientation for 10 hours a week.

| foreign | language |
| :--- | :--- |
| language | course |

dual medium schools didn't seem an ideal kind of bilingual education, need new intervention, we need new need Xhosa to intervention be taught right through
dual mediym
doesn't
support
language
learning L1 important in lyarning

Now that to me is where we must be teaching a second language - in that sort of fun way That, to me, is the ideal opportunity. But we have to have teachers that can do it.

P: ... a school policy thing about teachers who can do that - who can teach it well ...
J : Yes.
P: So you would suggest, for example, in teaching maths, people throughout South Africa, anyway, tend to use English because numbers in other African languages are often difficult.
J: Yes.
P: So - English is repetitive in maths.
J: Yes.
P: But you say arts and culture, to be fun, could be done in the second language.
J: Absolutely. And where it's not dependent on the language as to whether you'll pass or fail. You don't have a written assessment, or whatever. You could do so much in those sort of other subjects - where assessment is conversational - make a little play - act out the play - take some folk lore and that sort of thing.

You could do quite a lot there, but nobody is going to.
P: Maybe our image should - because it's called "language and arts education - we combined to language education with arts ... and I think (they're having?) good value in ..
J: I didn't do her arts and culture course.
P : No - but she (Delport?) is going to offer a Masters module. That's what Mike Barry wants to do. So if we could link that to a second language medium - arts and culture that could be fun
J : Yes. And bringing in some more of this teaching English as a foreign language. Those sort of concepts - to make it fun. We can encourage more teachers who are going to be teaching English in that way. Like (Lulama?), for example.

I = Interviewer
J = Jane
$\mathrm{P}=$ Professor
$\qquad$








language in fun
way - to me language ideal situation, learning in need teachers fun way who can do it need teachors who can do it
not dependant not on language dependant whether pass or on language fail - no written to pass assessment, just conversational

- could do such much in these subjects
language needs to help to conmunicate
could do a lot there but

nobody is going cąn do it
$\qquad$

$\qquad$  -



## Appendix 9 Summarizing Content Analysis Lydia



I: Any qualification which you feel was not very helpful - a waste of time?
language as
L: No - I think everything really helped me.
I: Now your current teaching situation. You don't have one class - you have several classes and they always come into your class - and they stay with you?

L: Yes, for a period of 55 minutes they stay.
I: What grades?
L: This year I'm teaching grade 8, 5 classes of 46 children each - and one class of 43 children in grade 9 .
I: Your pupils - I know you have Afrikaans mother tongue speakers, but do you have other mother tongue speakers as well?
L: Yes - Xhosa speaking.
I: How do you feel ... David Livingstone used to be only an Afrikaans speaking school how is it to have different mother tongue speakers in the class as well now?
L: It is difficult for the children, I suppose, seeing that Afrikaans is not their first language - and it's frustrating for the teacher as well. Because you don't know whether they always understand you - and the feedback that you sometimes get ... you don't know whether they understand what's going on.
I: And do you speak Xhosa?
L: Yes, I speak a little conversational Xhosa and I understand it as well.
I: If you have the feeling in class that you don't know whether they really understand, would you use Xhosa in class to the pupils - or maybe if the parents come to see you?
L: Only on a conversational level, but not on a teaching level.
I: Now, after the Apartheid era, they have mixed schools - rather than only English speaking schools or only Xhosa schools - so they are all mixed. When you say that you now have Xhosa speaking children in your class, obviously that has also happened at David Livingstone. Coloured and black children. To what extent does this happen?
L: There are quite a few now (meaning black children?).
I: Does having a mixed school now make changes to the way you teach in your classes?
L: Definitely it means you must make changes to your classes in terms of your language, in
well


#### Abstract

 



A

Afrikaans and
Xhosa mother
tongue speakers di difficult for children as
Afrikaans is not
L1 frustrating for the teacher as you don't know whether they understand you
speak and understand conversational
Xhosa
speaks
conversa-
tional Xhosa
would not use it not using it on teaching in teaching

K4 in South Africa:

- no test for L2 speakers
- send to other school if problems too big


## K5 teachers in <br> multilingual classrooms:

- different L1
speakers in
class >
changes
way
language
used
- can also use
other
languages
to explain
- Afrikaans school
- learners allowed to use L1 in class
- learners help each other
- no L2
classes
- dictionaries not used
- pro additive bilingualis m
terms of how you address the pupils - seeing that you have different cultures as well in your class.
I: Does OBE have any consequence for the way you use language with the pupils?
L: I don't teach languages as such.
I: How you use language with the pupils (regarding OBE)?
L : There is a change in how you use language, because it doesn't mean that you just have to use Afrikaans. You can use English words as well, just to explain to them. Most of them know (... things) and they don't know the Afrikaans for that. If you use the English word, they will know exactly what you are talking about.
I: How does the school react if the pupils aren't fluent in Afrikaans yet?

L: Our school doesn't have a language policy yet. We are an Afrikaans speaking school and if the pupils come there and their mother tongue is something else, the policy at this stage is still Afrikaans.
I: If I come to your school and my Afrikaans is not good, do I need to do a test?
L: No.
I: So if they don't speak Afrikaans very well, do they still have a chance to attend your school?
L: Well, if they come from other Afrikaans schools - because some of them go to the (family?) schools and if they come from those schools, we usually take them. But if we see that the child really has a language problem, then we rather ask the parents to come and we ask the parents to put them into an English school.
I: How do you deal with children in the class who are second language learners? Do you teach them differently in a way?
L: This is very difficult, because you can't put 46 children in a class - you can't give those children special attention. You need to finish your work. You try to help them.
I: Would the pupils be allowed to use their mother tongue in class?
you address
pupils-different cultures
don't teach languages as such
with OBE, change in how you use language -doesn't only have to be Afrikaans, also English to help explain as they often know English word
school doesn't
have language policy yet, Afrikaans speaking school no test
if they come
from other Afrikaans school we take them, if there is a real language problem we ask parents to put
them in English school
with 46
children in class, can't give those children special attention, need to finish work, try to help them
different cultures
teaches
content
subject
changes in
using
łanguage
can also use
other
languages to
explain

Afrikaans
speaking
school
no test
learners ask
to go to
other school
if problems are too big
high
numbers of learners in class cannot give special attention to L2 learners

L: Yes - I do allow them, because sometimes if they don't understand something, those who understand will explain to them in their mother tongue. For me, it's not a problem, as long as they understand what is expected of them.
I: Other teachers wouldn't say "don't do it"?
L: No.
I: If they struggle with the language and they make mistakes, how would you deal with it? Would you treat them differently from mother tongue speakers?
L: The numbers make it difficult. You try to explain to them and give them the correct words and explain how to use them - but in terms of individual attention, it's difficult.
I: Is there something like second language classes at your school - Afrikaans classes where they can improve their reading or writing skills?

L: No. We have problems in terms of that, because those kids aren't staying near the school. They have to travel distances to get to school - so it's difficult for them to stay after school.
I: You can speak conversational Xhosa. Are there times when you'd like to speak Xhosa and just tell them straight away?
L: Yes.
I: What kind of moments would they be?
L: If you feel that the child really doesn't understand the instructions or the content or you as a teacher.
I: You say that the students are allowed to speak to each other in Xhosa, that's one way to overcome the communication problem - are there other ways.
L: The other learners - Afrikaans speaking also help them. Because some of them come from the same primary schools. They know each other and I suppose they know that some of them have difficulty with the language and they try to encourage and help them as well.
I: Do you use dictionaries?
L: In the language classes, they do.
I: But not so much in the content subject
allow them to use their mother allowed to tongue if they use L1 don't understand, others will explain, not a problem as long as they
understand numbers make it difficult, try to explain and give correct words and explain how to use them, individual attention difficult
no second no second
language language
classes as classes
students can't
stay after school because
of travel
distance
like to use would like
Xhosa in to use Xhosa
moments when
you feel child
doesn't
understand
instruction, content or teacher other learners also help to overcome communication problems
dictionaries
only used in
language
learners help each other
classes?
L: No
I: I want in my research to look at the multilingual teacher. Do you have an idea about what would be an ideal multilingual teacher?
L: An ideal multilingual teacher would be fluent in the languages. For instance in the Eastern Cape it's important to be able to speak Afrikaans, English and Xhosa . That's an ideal situation. As I say, in the Eastern Cape. But if you go to KwaZulu Natal, for instance, you have to speak Zulu instead of Xhosa. So it depends on where you are.
I: You say that's your idea of a multilingual teacher. How do you feel you can be best prepared for that? If you look at teacher training courses, how do you fee you can prepare for being such a multilingual teacher?
L: I think it's a difficult one, because at college - and I suppose at university as well - the languages they use are either Afrikaans or English or both. But they don't really introduce Xhosa at that level. But some of the schools do have Xhosa as a subject. So it's better for those children to start learning Xhosa at an early age - and to be able to speak the language and understand and carry on with it. But to go to college or university - to be part of that training - I don't know whether that is possible. But it is necessary and important.
I: To be able to speak the language, obviously you have to do language courses. You talked about Honours and other modules - would you say that it's also something that helps you to be more aware?
L: Yes - definitely.
I: We spoke about additive bilingualism, where you have the mother tongue that you maintain and then only when you have the basis of the mother tongue, that you learn a second language. How do you feel about additive bilingualism? Do you think it's a good way to go or is it going the wrong way?
L: I think that it is a good way to go - so that you know your mother tongue as a first language and then you can learn a second or third language after that..
I: These are all my questions I had on my paper.
classes
an ideal multilingual important to teacher would know be fluent in the languages of languages of the learner
important to
learn
languages
early
and understand language and language and
carry on with it, $\begin{array}{ll}\text { should be part } & \text { should be } \\ \text { of training at } & \text { part of }\end{array}$ $\begin{array}{ll}\text { should be part } & \text { should be } \\ \text { of training at } & \text { part of }\end{array}$ university better to start learning language at early age, to be able to speak higher education
pro additive bilingualism
additive
bilingualism
good way to go
$\mathrm{I}=$ Interviewer
$\mathrm{L}=\mathrm{Lydia}$

## Appendix 10 Summarizing Content Analysis Sarah


something from them but it was not enough for the teaching experiences. So it was tough because there was nothing, there was no work done, nothing in the classroom, it was just the walls. So I had to develop personally the classroom in terms of putting nice pictures and to build that [...] atmosphere for the learners otherwise learners wouldn't move in, they escaped. So that was the start of my teaching. And then we started with the in-service training meaning attending the workshops. There were too many workshops, so much that you were not [..] of what you were doing. But until, should be 1999, I got a big picture. So I used what I've learned from those workshops. But now in a big picture I know exactly what I want to be. Take only the things that I think are important in my teaching.

And we had coordinators whom we would have [...] when we needed help for our lessons, whom visit our classroom and then we talk so much about our learners. So we had that support from them. And in fact when you look back I can't even look on the planning booklet I started to using. It's totally different. And creativity is one thing that I've learned as a teacher. Before I started teaching, one belief in programs, to use a program that is build by other people, and those people know what they are doing, but you follow something that you don't know. But right now I'm not using any program. I'm developing my lessons and I focus on my creativity and it must be always relevant to the level of the learners. So that the difference of now and then.
I: So you would say that now is definitely a lot more satisfying for you, for yourself as a teacher.
S: Mmmh. And we're focusing on outcome-based. So you do what is good for you. Not what the [...] made once for you.
I: You already said a bit about where you did your teacher education. Where was that? Where did you do your teacher training?
important > support from coordinators

- creativity important
- must be relevant for learners
- sharing important > educating colleagues
- confidence
important
- always teaching and learning

K4 in South Africa:

- bad education and training because of the system during apartheid
- school management important
- developing the community > educating parents > communicating with parents makes teaching easier
- support of trust
- white education for all
- closing the gap =
there are often
gaps
- legacy of apartheid
- keeping the standard


## K5 teachers in

multilingual classrooms

- group work important
- also Xhosa L2
speakers
- small numbers
- not feeling threatened by other languages
- wouldn't use knowledge of other languages in class
- different approach with learners with

course at the teacher college and now you are doing further qualifications or more qualifications... what you do at U.P.E., or you've done your B.Ed Hons. If you can tell me...
S: I've got that junior teacher's diploma. I went for further diploma in education through the university of Natal for two years. Then after that I went for the B.Ed in teacher education for Honours through U.P.E. So now I'm doing my Master's Education at U.P.E.
I: And when you look at all the courses you have done or modules or extra qualifications, is there something were you say that was really really helpful for me?
S: Oh yes, oh yes. Most modules in both universities - at university I've done school improvement, school management, school effectiveness And there was a good module about partnership between education and business. And it was about systems. So I started to know better about education as a system . And further I started to understand what management is. And how do you get a school that is very effective through those modules. And also U.P.E., it was similar, I've also done school improvement, school management. What I learned through the two universities, they had same modules, but in different ways of approach. So it was not a repetition of what I had done in Natal. It was a new approach. And the one in Honours was very applicable because as you know that at school we had projects. When I was tackling those modules, they maybe they will ask me to use a [...] and take any program or project in [...] developing my school. I didn't plan for the projects because projects are already there. It's only I had to apply, and it must be applicable to the spint (?) that I'm asked to apply. So it was only a paperwork more than thinking of how can I make a book for the school. So I've realised as well that it's about doing the right right thing
doing the right thing. If the modules are telling me about the development of the school and in the same way that we're doing, then we are in the right track. Then I confirm to my project coordinator we're in the right track. Then I started to ask her how did you get this teacher. And she said to me, it's not a big picture, it's something that grows. It's relevant to your module, and I didn't know that we were working towards it.
I: And also, now you described what you found very helpful. Are there also things, extra qualifications or courses you did where you think that was a bit of a waste of time or not very helpful?
S: $\quad$ Not really. I mean the principal course. And I mentioned to you that we had seven farm schools, and now we are in the central school. So had seven principals applying for the principal post for the new school. So I'm different from other people because I learned the different schools through my modules. And there were key studies whom I always relate to my school. And I've learned that most principals, they learned... they upgrade their qualifications because of the status. Not because of sharing what they learned or developing at their schools. So I've learned a lot, especially in the management modules.
thing - when we are doing it the same way as the modules tell us we're on the right track
k key studies I using for could relate to my teaching school
others upgrade qualifications because of status, important not because of sharing what they further qualifieation learned sharing
important
I: I know have a few questions about your current teaching situation. Where are you teaching at the moment?
S: I'm teaching in Tarkastad. Tarkastad is in the northern cape of Eastern Cape. And the school, it's 25 km from Tarkastad. So it's on the way along [ ...]. So it's a rural, but it's a collection of schools. Then we've got a Winterberg School Trust, which was formed by farmers with their entries (?). Because before there were no schools, and the little ones had to leave their homes to get studies. So they decided to concentrate on the development of the schools.
I: And it's also quite a special school in that...
S: It's a special because as I was saying
they started developing teachers ... teacher
development program. After we realised we'd been skilled but there were still some obstacles that makes the learning not to blow. Then we thought of developing the community because parents are illiterate. And the problems we had before, it's like high rate of absenters, because the parents don't see the value of educating their learners. And also there was a problem of distance. Some learners were walking for more than 20 km , some more than 50 km .

But because of the help from the Winterberg School Trust we overcome those problems.
And right now we are a school with a community, because we've got a community projects. So meaning that you are sharing same resources for the parents.

And in name that my teaching now is kind of simpler because I'm meeting a parent two times a week than before. Before there was no communication. And parents know nothing about what was in the school. But now we've got that bond between parents and the teachers, also teachers and learners. Because as learners they know that the teacher knows their parent. They started to behave.
I: You have already said you teach in a grade two. How many pupils are in your class? S: About 14.
I: Quite a small class.
S: In fact even in that small class I'm still teaching group work , cooperative teaching because [...]
I: And in your grade 2, do you have different mother tongue speakers? Or are they all Xhosa?
S: I do have one Afrikaans speaker but the Coloreds are not using the language even in the class. I'm sure it's because of the geographic background. The farm might have one family of one Afrikaans also Xhosa Coloreds, and then that family will speaker but not have to compromise to use the using language in language that is in the majority.
I: Are you able to speak Afrikaans?
S : Mmh-mmh, it's not a language that I
special school which started developing teachers
developing the community because parents are illiterate
high rate of educating $\begin{array}{ll}\text { high rate of } & \text { educating } \\ \text { absenters as } & \text { parents }\end{array}$ parents don't see value of education, problem of distance
with help of trust overcame these problems
community projects, sharing same resources with parents
my teaching is
simpler now as there is communication, bond between teacher and parents, and teacher and learners class
in-service training important
developing the community
support of trust


ไommunicat ion with parents important naking
teaching
easier
small numbers of learners
use. But I've done it at school and also
for my training.
I: And obviously there is just the one boy. Do I understand it right that he is done Afrikaans at wouldn't actually Afrikaans mother tongue school and in use speaking, or has his family also training, but not a Afrikaans decided that they also speak Xhosa in language I use the family because they live in this Xhosa speaking area.
S: The mother speaks Afrikaans. But I don't know what is going on after school. I don't want to maybe. But what I know, you can't differentiate that child from Xhosa children.
I: You said you have been teaching for eight years, when you started teaching did you have in your class only Xhosa mother tongue speakers in the beginning?
S: In the beginning it was only Xhosa.
I: And how do you feel now with having different mother tongue speakers in your class?
S: I'm not feeling threatened or I'm not feeling unhappy because first of all in grade 2 only focussing two languages that is Xhosa and English. And English, it's not that much, it's just communication skills.

So really for me to learn more about the language, it's not something that I'm going to apply in the classroom when I'm teaching.
I: And if you say, you learned a bit of Afrikaans at school. Would you use ever use it with the pupils in the classroom.
S: I never use it. Even in eight years back.
I: And you wouldn't also use it to the parents, or...no...
S: Parents are communicating with my mother tongue. So it's not that, they use the language, I mean Xhosa, as an official language, it's like a mother tongue to them. Cause they couldn't
don't know which language is łanguage spoken after spoken in school, don't the home of want to maybe, can't differentiate child from Xhosa children children in the beginning tred to be it was only Xhosa only Xhosa speaking children speakers not feeling threatened or not feeling unhappy in grade threatened 2 only focussing by other on two languages, languages only
communication
skills in English
to learn more wouldn't
about languages use
not something knowledge
I'm going to use of other
languages
wouldn't
use
Afrikaans [compete?]
never use
Afrikaans
$\begin{array}{lr}\text { parents also } & \begin{array}{r}\text { community } \\ \text { communicating } \\ \text { uses Xtrosa }\end{array}\end{array}$
I: That was your teaching experience and with me in Xhosa your teacher education, where you are teaching at the moment. What I find interesting, looking at my what I'm
going to do in my research. I find it interesting, since the end of Apartheid you have mixed schools now. It used to be only black schools, only white schools or colored schools, Indian schools. And I find it very interesting that...
S: $\quad$ So white education for all.
I: $\quad$ So now it's mixed schools and as you say when you started teaching it might have only been Xhosa speaking children or black children. And now you can also have colored children. So for all
that has also happened at your school that you have mixed schools. Did this mean for you that when you have now ... obviously it is different when this little boy or little girl comes to your school and can already speak Xhosa, it's different, but did it mean for you that having different children of different cultures, did it mean that you had to change your teaching in a way when you realised there are ... I mean did it mean that you changed the way you teach the children or...?
S: I'm not really sure because ....
S: ... the special child. Because I've done one module on [...] education. In the [...] all learners learn in one class and they've got different ways of learning. Some, they are learners with special needs. So I'll take this case like the one that one needs a special way of doing things. Then my approach will change, definitely. Because it is not about teaching, it is about teaching and learning. I learned from them, and they learned from me. So definitely my teaching will change.
they are learners different with special approach needs, my with approach and learners teaching will with special change, it's about needs teaching and learning, I learn always from them, they teaching learn from me and learning
white
education for all
I: But with this little boy in your class, he is so fluent in Xhosa that you...
e
S: $\quad$ So much that I don't even think that he is Afrikaans. He has struggled before. And then I started to send work at home. And then he's got an August place. And then I explained to him how learn from me we work, and he improved.
I: So there is a bit of, you need to change

S: You need to close the gap if there is a gap.
I: And what I also find interesting, we have already been talking about home outcomes-based education. Do you feel OBE and teaching to OBE standards, has it changed the way you teach language in the classroom. I mean obviously it has changed the way you teach in the classroom, but does it have an influence on how you handle language or how you use language to the pupils, how the pupils can use language in the classroom?
S: It was not really a change in the [...] of using the language. It was only in the constitution for OBE that each school must have two languages instead of three languages. That was the only change. Otherwise about language, they never say anything about how we use the language until I learned from my studies, about bilingual [...]. And I am fortunate because at school we realised that language is the problem And in the ends we've got better results. So we all made it happen the language problem before the department decided on the outcomesbased. But I'm sure we're in the process of how we're going to tackle it until as from last year we had that research proposal that will [...] additive bilingual this year.

So I might say I've learned about language not from the department, but from my studies probably the most things I have done. ... And research on I'm not sure that other teacher or some additive teachers from other schools know exactly what bilingualism I know because before we used to think that Xhosa learners who are studying in the white schools, we thought because they speak the language fluent and we think that they think with the [...] upon language. And we didn't see it as a problem with those learners but they are not free to use their cognitive until I learned to study. bilingual education better results
language learner
strugglers I give work at
that learners home
$\qquad$
in my studies I learning
learned about about we realised that realising language is the language is problem and got the problem
language not from the department, but from my studies before when fluency in Xhosa learners language studying at white misleads
$\left.\begin{array}{llll}\hline \text { they never learned from any module, they } & \begin{array}{l}\text { fluent in the } \\ \text { started to isolate you because it was not the } \\ \text { information we knew before. It is a new thing } \\ \text { to us. So you need to convince them, you need } \\ \text { to give them examples to see it. And you need } \\ \text { them to educate your colleagues. Otherwise }\end{array} & \begin{array}{l}\text { cognitive } \\ \text { didn't see the } \\ \text { cobelem with the } \\ \text { cogntive } \\ \text { ment }\end{array} & \text { important }\end{array}\right]$
the students have to do a language test to show how good the Xhosa of my child would be? Do you have by end of year, something like a language test to prove L2 speaker if I come into pre-primary and the writing in Xhosa child...
S: Oh yes, but it's not in the constitution of the school. It's something that I'm doing for my benefit. When I've got a new learner, I always assess that learner. Because before I teach him or her, I should know where the problems, if she is having problems from other schools debate, then the work that I've already done in the middle of the week.
language test not no test from in the constitution school
of school, but something I do
And if it is in the beginning of the year I always start with revision of the previous grade. Then I've got results from that assessment. Then I will consider also that I've got learners who need help in those areas.
for my benefit, I always assess new learner because need to know problems
I: But that might also be for mother before I teach tongue speakers who comes from a different school or something?
S: It happened before. I've got twins, there were in the Afrikaans school and they can't write Xhosa. So now I'm starting grade 1 work , starting with single phonemes. And one, she 's moving. And the other one I'm sure he's not [...] than the girl. And I see the progress from the one who is [...] too. During holiday you'll give them books to read so that they read incidental through learning the phonemes. Otherwise they're tackling it.
I: And if you say ... we just talked about the twins, and they came from an Afrikaans school...
S: But their mother tongue is Xhosa.
I: And how do you then deal with pupils who are second language learners like this boy who is Afrikaans mother tongue speaking and he comes to your school and into your classroom. How do you deal with second language learners?
S: I'm sure we are fortunate because we've got grade R. That is a pre-school learning. There is a good improvement

L2 speaker usually catch up quickly
teacher tests
new
learners
if it is beginning
of year, always start with revision considering from last year, learners consider learners who need who need help in help
after
assessment
considerng
learners
why need
help
during holidays, I give them books
to read so they
can read and
learn phonemes
that learners
work $/ \mathrm{t}$
hone
with the preparation for the first term
In the previous years you were doing school-readiness with your learners, meaning that we have to show the learners how to hold a pencil, or do in grade R , colouring in, how to organise their preparation for work. But we're not doing that first year, preanymore because pre-school is already school learning done that. So I'm sure I'm like this boy because he was coming from a preschool. And in this pre-school it is a Xhosa teacher. And I'm sure she was not compromising for using Afrikaans. So when he came into my classroom he was just fluent in Xhosa And I couldn't even notice that he's an Afrikaans speaker until I've realised that he's struggled with phonemes . And there it was just a minor problem. where L2
It was not a major ...like... he was not speakers learn the only one, there were about six. And language and are he managed to cover them, I mean the fluent in Xhosa in phonemes before the other five could. my class So it was about the process of understanding what we are doing more than the language as a problem.
I: But if they do struggle, do they have like second language courses, extra lessons they can attend after school, that they do language courses?
S: No, it's not a course but as you are doing your group teaching. You will teach the whole class and then you give the one who understands the activity or the work, then you will leave behind with the one that you notice struggle. So we go slowly, we think [...] you've done.
I: And repeat it. That is probably also with mother tongue speakers, they can also struggle... or some of them are slower...
S: They do. That one is not the only one with the problems.
I: In your classroom, how do you deal with linguistic mistakes? If they make errors or mistakes, how do you deal with when the say something incorrect or use the wrong grammar. Would you correct it?
S: If it is an oral work or activity, I just
also mother
tongue speakers
struggle
in pre-school, Xhosa teacher

L2 learners
struggling with
phonemes
more about
understanding what we are doing than language problem
not second no second
language classes, languages
classes


L2 learners struggle with language

butcaching in groups, going slower with the ones who struggle
preparation in grade R
preparation in grade $R$

give a flow for the lesson. But if it's a written work, then I'll show where the error is and then I will call the child to discuss with me. Because it happened, especially in the ... it's not linguist, it's about spelling, maybe omission of letters and [...]. Because we're dealing with little things with the [...] It's not about major problems. So you don't correct things once they're demonstrating because really, it is just an embarrassment to them. When it is a major error, then you start to address it, but not in the whole class. Maybe you can even ask one learner if one can correct it.
I: And also, I read in your work that you also sometimes after the lesson, you would write in onto the blackboard, this wrong sentence and then discuss it.
S: Yes, discuss it.
I: And do you take into consideration whether it is a mother tongue speaker or second language learner who makes the mistake? Or is that not...
S: Before it was not... I didn't consider it. But now after I did the module I realised it is really important. Because you can't expect a second language speaker to be in the same level with a person who is in the mother tongue.
I: And when you now say, that you realised that a second language learner will be in a different level and it might be more difficult for him or her. Do you sometimes wish you could speak the mother tongue to them when you realise they struggle.
S: Oh yes.
I: In which situations would you think 'now I would really like to speak the mother tongue of the child'?
S: I don't have a specific situation because really Afrikaans is not in my background. In P.E. we don't have Afrikaans speakers until you go to work. And when I was at school I had no interact with Afrikaans speakers. So it was a language just you learned, but no communication skills. And I would have said English was better than
in oral work, give flow for lesson, in written work I show the error and discuss it
not correcting
when they are
demonstrating as
it is embarrassing for them, a major
error you address,
but not in front of whole class, ask a
learner to correct
flow is
important
correct
written
work
not
correcting
in front of
whole class
learners
correct
write onto
blackboard and
discuss error error
before didn't
consider whether
it was L1 or L2
speaker making
the mistake, now
I know that it's
important and
that you can't
expect L2 learner
to be on the same
level as L1
speaker
wish could speak
mother tongue
when they
struggle
Afrikaans is not in my
background

L2 speaker not on the same level as L1 speaker important to speak mother tongue of learners
wouldn't
asfrikaans


|  | really want to say. | learner as | using |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| I: | What I'm interested in looking at is a multilingual teacher. Especially in South Africa it is so interesting. And what would be in your opinion an ideal multilingual teacher, if you had to describe this teacher, what would be your picture of that teacher? | interpret if there is communication problem <br> using gestures and body movement to | learners as interpreters <br> body language |
| S: | I'd take that teacher from Houteng (?) because that's were a multilingual of the eleven languages. You know here in Eastern Cape, the majority is only Xhosa people. They won't even know Zulu. Zulu, it's similar to Xhosa, it's speaker there and then. But in Houteng you will find that in one area, you'll find different people speaking all eleven languages, meaning that you have to communicate with each person with his or her mother tongue. At the end of the day, you will find people understand six languages, speak fluently, are proficient in six languages out of learning. But here in the Eastern Cape we've only got three languages unless you've got one African language, meaning your parents, maybe your mother, it's a clan from those areas ... tribes. Otherwise, in the Eastern Cape, we've only got three languages. But in Houteng you will get a multilingual teacher, and that teacher is very confident, is good in communication. And it helps that teacher to mix easily with other people because of that confidence of the using the language. Language helps a lot in terms of communication skills . Our children are speaking English fluent than us because the system is different. There are in the multiple choice school, my child is in a private school. So you'll realise that by the age of eight years, nine years, you can ask the child to go anywhere. He can express himself and be comfortable where he is, unlike us. We were like in jail, you wanted to express yourself, but you don't know how to express yourself. And it makes you to have those complex and anxiety, you have that | show child what I want to say <br> in the Eastern Cape three languages <br> a multilingual teacher is confident, good in communication, helps him to mix easily with other people, language helps in terms of communication skills <br> we were like in | important <br> confidence important <br> commundcation skills important |


find that interesting, the connection with culture and language. My last see importance of question on this paper, we have been using both speaking a lot about additive language and bilingualism and you were telling me content about this pilot project you do at your simultaneously school. How do you personally feel about additive bilingualism? Do you think it is a good way to go? Or you a bit ... how do you feel about it?
S: Oh yes, I agree with additive bilingualism because I understand it is hoping. We'll be practice with this additive for a couple of nine years, meaning that we will start with our grades R this year. And If I'm talking about nine years, those grade by the I agree with pro additive time they're doing grade 12 they will additive bilingualism have $50 \%$ proficiency in both bilingualism, it is languages, meaning that in grade R hoping they are only introduced in English for about $5 \% .5 \%$ will be maybe 13 or 16 minutes lesson per week by a white lady, I mean an English speaker . It's still going to be hard work for us because of that one lesson from [my teacher?] . She tried to introduce a rhyme lesson, and there were instruction in the lesson. But learners because they are second English English speaker speakers, they couldn't move, and she had to use gestures, and they were just going to be hard staring at her. Maybe she was different work because of the colour, and also she's got long hair. And I don't know, I'll have a better comment towards the end of this year when we I really get a full picture of what I can in terms of doing it critical. Otherwise theoretical, I can agree with it.
I: And do you feel that doing that they’ always learn their mother tongue in a good way?
S: Yes, because what we're doing from the previous year, we're doing some subtractive bilingualism. And we are better comment at pro additive later stage, but can agree with bilingualism not aware of the damage until one highlighted that we're only using our mother tongue in assented (?) as from grade 4. Then we realised with what before we were damage of we've done in the foundation phase, using subtractive subtractive
there is a gap with what we're doing in the intermediate phase. The only learn the language in the foundation phase.
bilingualism and bilingualism were not aware of the damage

And then there are not happy if I can tell you the truth. You'll be teaching, and they will be very confused. Not a happy face you'll see because they don't understand what you're saying.
I: With the additive bilingualism approach, do you feel they will be fluent in English by the time they write their ... in which language would they write their matric?
S: As from last year, there was a proposal from the [...], minister of education that learners will have instructions in all eleven languages. So meaning they are going to express themselves in their mother tongue. I don't know when we're starting, I'm interested.
I: And that means that they can also write their final exam ...
S: ... in their mother tongue. And before I started to know about the bilingual and know, I said oh we're losing. We're losing the standards because if everything is going to be in their mother tongue one don't be proficient in other languages. But now I know the reason for doing it, it's about understanding instructions. And giving the gap now for the learners to express themselves ... maybe they will say they must write it in English but the instruction should be in Xhosa . It's possible. Because we still have to keep that standard of using a universal language. We still have communicating in it.
I: So that were all my questions on my matric in English, paper. Thank you for answering all of but instructions in them. [...] But most questions were Xhosa straight forward...
S: Yes, they were, they were relevant.
[...] And it's nice also to recall.
gap between there are foundation and often gaps intermediate phase
learners are not happy, they're confused because they don't understand what you're saying
before I knew about additive bilingualism I thought we're losing the standards if everything is in mother tongue, won't be proficient in other languages, now I know it's about understanding the instructions important/
we still need to keep standard of using universal language
important/
that leaners
understand
instructions, important/
that leanners
understand
instructions, important/
that leaners
understand
instructions, etc.
important that learners understand instructions, etc.
keeping the standard

that learners
understand
instructions, etc.
keepring the standard

I = Interviewer
S = Sarah

## Appendix 11 Structure-Formation-Technique Ruth

In the classes there are different mother-tongue speakers and children with different cultural backgrounds, which the teacher enjoys.

One never stops learning, especially with a new generation of children and parents.

Being a teacher means having a love for people. Always knew that she wanted to be a teacher.

What now seems so natural, e.g. hugging and kissing a black child, took quite a while $>$ Apartheid culture was ingrained.

Some teachers used to be unsympathetic towards children who speak English as a second or third language.

| An ideal multilingual teacher |
| :--- |
| would be multilingual herself, |
| very open and willing to learn |
| from the pupils. | | L1 English, |
| :--- |
| L2 Afrikaans, |
| wish to learn Xhosa. |

OBE had an influence on language teaching $>$ changed the teacher's concept $>$ participation / interaction of pupils is very important.

Not being able to use the mother-tongue could make a child introverted and inhibited (especially when doing brainstorming, etc.).

The teacher has changed her mind that the learners always have to speak English, only because it is an English medium school.

| Dealing with linguistic <br> mistakes $>$ the teacher <br> changed her mind about if <br> and how to correct linguistic <br> mistakes.$\longrightarrow$No other language was used <br> beside English in class of the <br> pupils, although it would be <br> good to use other languages. |
| :--- |

Additive bilingualism? > English as the language of power, which might enable a person to have a better life in the future.

Teacher feels it has an impact on her teaching that she is teaching at a privileged school (only minor problems).

Language tests at the school make it easier for the teacher to decide the level of competence rather than being "slotted in".

The teacher believes that determination and intelligence helps to strive in a language that is not one's mother-tongue.

Reading is very important when learning a language.

The family background of a child is important as a foundation and as stimulation.


Dual-medium schools > teacher attended a dualmedium school as a child and also taught at one > believes it makes pupils lazy to listen and try to understand other languages.

## Appendix 12 Structure-Formation-Technique Jane

An ideal multilingual teacher would understand the languages in the class and what is behind them, the culture.

L1 English, L2 Afrikaans, would love to learn Xhosa, but only uses English in class as it is an English-medium school.

A second language should be taught in a fun way
$>$ no pressure.
To be equipped for teaching in a multilingual context, a teacher should...
$>$ study overseas
$>$ do teacher training courses (already early
in education)
$>$ research

There are different mother-tongue speakers in her class since mixed schools have increasingly become the norm.

Maths as a content subject > the language always needs to be simplified, also for L1 learners.

The teacher finds group work very important > in the groups the learners can speak their mother-tongue.

OBE has changed the way The teacher is not of teaching, but not the correcting grammatical usage of language in a content language classroom.
mistakes, but she paraphrases what the learners say in a correct way.

The interaction is more important than grammatical correctness $>$ to bring the message across.

L2 learners are not catered for > there are no intervention courses.

The teacher does not feel that having mixed classes has changed her way of teaching.

Other concepts of language teaching like dual-medium schools and submersion do not work for the majority of learners.

The teacher feels ambivalent about the concept of "additive bilingualism" $>$ something might called so which is not necessarily it.

The teacher thinks she is going to miss teaching as she finds children very rewarding.

The teacher has taught at different schools, boys only, girls only, mixed, rich and poor schools.

The teacher feels she needs new challenges Because she is getting a bit bored with teaching and looses her energy and enthusiasm.

She is doing extra qualifications and especially enjoys doing research in her modules > practical and hands-on, no more theory

